

The Greek Witnesses on 1 Timothy 4:13, c. 150–1100

Greek text with English translation

Three Doves Press · © 2026 Albert B. Collver III

Greek text read from the printed page in the editions listed at the end, with accents, breathings and punctuation as printed (Field's grave accent before a comma included); misprints are kept and noted, and the older pagination and the editors' note numbers carried in the text are omitted. NPNF translations are adapted: archaic forms are modernized and the English is brought into line with the Greek printed here. Lightfoot's translation of 2 Clement and the Authorized Version of the Sirach prologue are treated in the same way. Translations not otherwise attributed are by the editor. Companion to Albert B. Collver III, "The Public Reading of Scripture," <https://news.collver.biz/the-public-reading-of-scripture/>. Published at <https://misc.collver.biz/greek-witnesses-1tim413.pdf>.

PREFACE

"The Public Reading of Scripture" argued that the noun in 1 Timothy 4:13, ἀνάγνωσις, "reading," does not carry its setting with it. The same word names a man's study of his books and the lesson read aloud in the assembly, and in every case something in the context, not the word, tells the reader which is meant. This collection prints the Greek on which that argument rests, with an English translation facing it, so that the claim can be tested sentence by sentence. It also gives the passages of John Chrysostom for which the paper had no room.

Part I gathers Chrysostom: his exposition of the verse, his use of it for the priest's study, and the sermons in which he describes the church's lection and bids the laity read at home. Part II gives the Greek commentators on 4:13, from the catena to Theophylact of Ohrid. Part III sets the word beside its uses elsewhere, from the prologue to Sirach to the chronicle of Malalas, and each headnote names the words in the context that decide the sense. Every Greek text was read from a page image of the edition cited.

PART I
John Chrysostom

I.1 HOMILY 13 ON I TIMOTHY, ON 4:13–16

Chrysostom's own exposition of the verse. He glosses the noun himself as "the reading of the divine writings," turns the command to all ("let us all hear"), and grounds it in Paul's study of the prophets; no reader, deacon, or assembly appears anywhere in the comment.¹

«Ἔως ἔρχομαι, πρόσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει, τῇ παρακλήσει, τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ.» Τιμοθέω κελεύει προσέχειν τῇ ἀναγνώσει. Ἀκούωμεν ἅπαντες, καὶ παιδεύμεθα μὴ ἀμελεῖν τῆς τῶν θείων μελέτης. Ἰδοὺ πάλιν, «Ἔως ἔρχομαι,» φησὶν. Ὅρα πῶς αὐτὸν παραμυθεῖται· εἰκὸς γὰρ αὐτὸν ἀπορφανισθέντα ζητεῖν αὐτόν. «Ἔως ἔρχομαι, φησὶ, πρόσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει,» τῇ τῶν θείων γραφῶν. «τῇ παρακλήσει,» τῇ πρὸς ἀλλήλους. «τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ. Μὴ ἀμέλει τοῦ ἐν σοὶ χαρίσματος, ὃ ἐδόθη σοι διὰ προφητείας.» Τὴν διδασκαλίαν φησὶν ἐνταῦθα. «Μετὰ ἐπιθέσεως τῶν χειρῶν τοῦ πρεσβυτερίου.» Οὐ περὶ πρεσβυτέρων φησὶν ἐνταῦθα, ἀλλὰ περὶ ἐπισκόπων· οὐ γὰρ δὴ πρεσβύτεροι τὸν ἐπίσκοπον ἐχειροτόνουν.

"Till I come, give attendance to reading, to exhortation, to teaching." He bids Timothy attend to reading.² Let us all hear, and be instructed³ not to neglect the study of divine things.⁴ Again, observe, he says, "Till I come." Mark how he consoles him; for it was natural that, left as it were an orphan, he should long for him. "Till I come," he says, "give attendance to reading," that is, of the divine writings; "to exhortation," that is, of one another; "to teaching."⁵ "Neglect not the gift that is in you, which was given you by prophecy." Here he means teaching.⁶ "With the laying on of the hands of the presbytery." He speaks not here of Presbyters, but of Bishops. For Presbyters cannot be supposed to have ordained a Bishop.

«Ταῦτα μελέτα, ἐν τούτοις ἴσθι.» Ὅρα πῶς

"Meditate upon these things; give

¹Greek: Field, *Interpretatio* 6:104–05 (Oxford, 1861), from the lemma of 4:13 to the end of the comment on chapter 4; checked against PG 62:565–66. Field's quotation marks are shown as «», and his apparatus sigla are omitted. PG, following Savile and Montfaucon, reads τῇ παρανέσει for τῇ παρακλήσει in the lemma, τῆς τῶν θείων Γραφῶν μελέτης for τῆς τῶν θείων μελέτης, and ζητεῖν without αὐτόν, and it adds a clause after ῥαθυμούμεν. English: NPNF¹ 13:449–50, adapted. NPNF translates the Savile–Montfaucon text, so several of the changes noted below simply bring its English into line with Field's Greek.

²NPNF: "Even Timothy is commanded to apply to reading." The Greek has no "even" (Τιμοθέω κελεύει), and the verb is active.

³NPNF omits Ἀκούωμεν ἅπαντες, "let us all hear."

⁴NPNF: "the study of the sacred writings," from the older editions' τῆς τῶν θείων Γραφῶν μελέτης. Field reports γραφῶν as an addition (note f); the gloss a few lines below supplies it.

⁵NPNF: "to exhortation of one another, to teaching of all." Its "of all" renders τῇ πρὸς πάντας, which Field reports as an addition of the older editions (note i) and does not print.

⁶NPNF: "Here he calls teaching prophecy," from the older editions (Field, note k).

πολλάκις περὶ τῶν αὐτῶν αὐτῷ παρεγγυᾷ, δεῖξαι βουλόμενος, ὅτι μάλιστα πάντων ἐν τούτοις σπουδάζειν τὸν διδάσκαλον χρή. «Ἐπεχε σεαυτῷ, φησὶ, καὶ τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ, ἐπίμενε αὐτοῖς.» Τουτέστι, πρόσεχε σεαυτῷ, καὶ δίδασκε καὶ τοὺς λοιπούς. «Τοῦτο γὰρ ποιῶν, καὶ σεαυτὸν σώσεις, καὶ τοὺς ἀκούοντάς σου.» Ὁ γὰρ τοῖς τῆς διδασκαλίας ἐντρεφόμενος λόγοις, πρότερον αὐτὸς καρποῦται τὴν ὠφέλειαν· ἐν τῷ γὰρ παραινεῖν ἑτέροις, καὶ ἑαυτὸν κατανύσσει. Οὐ γὰρ δὴ πρὸς Τιμόθεον ταῦτα εἴρηται, ἀλλὰ πρὸς πάντας.

Εἰ δὲ τῷ νεκροῦς ἀνιστάντι ταῦτά φησι, τί ἐροῦμεν ἡμεῖς; Καὶ ὁ Χριστὸς δὲ φησιν· «Ὁς ἐκβάλλει ἐκ τοῦ θησαυροῦ αὐτοῦ καινὰ καὶ παλαιὰ, ὁμοίος ἐστὶν ἀνθρώπῳ οἰκοδεσπότη.» Καὶ πάλιν ὁ μακάριος Παῦλος φησιν· «Ἴνα διὰ τῆς ὑπομονῆς καὶ τῆς παρακλήσεως τῶν γραφῶν τὴν ἐλπίδα ἔχωμεν.» Καὶ μάλιστα πάντων αὐτὸς τοῦτο ἔπραττε, παρὰ τοὺς πόδας Γαμαλίου παιδευόμενος τὸν πατρῶον νόμον, ὥστε καὶ μετὰ ταῦτα αὐτὸν εἰκὸς προσέχειν τῇ ἀναγνώσει· ὁ γὰρ ἑτέροις ταῦτα παραινῶν, ἑαυτῷ προτέρῳ παρήνευσεν ἑαυτῷ.⁸

[p. 105] Ὅρας γοῦν αὐτὸν συνεχῶς ταῖς τῶν προφητῶν κεχρημένον μαρτυρίαις, καὶ θεωροῦντα τὰ ἐν αὐταῖς; Εἴτα Παῦλος μὲν προσέχει τῇ ἀναγνώσει· οὐ γὰρ ἐστὶ μικρὰν ἀπὸ τῶν γραφῶν ὠφέλειαν καρπώσασθαι.

yourself wholly to them.” Observe how often he gives him counsel concerning the same things, thus showing that a teacher ought above all things to be attentive to these points. “Take heed,” he says, “unto yourself, and unto the teaching: continue in them.” That is, take heed to yourself, and teach others also. “For in so doing you shall both save yourself and them that hear you.” For he that is nourished up in the words of teaching⁷ first receives the benefit of it himself. From admonishing others, he is touched with compunction himself. For these things are not said to Timothy only, but to all.

And if he says these things to one who raised the dead, what shall we say?⁹ Christ also says,¹⁰ “Whoever brings forth out of his treasure things new and old is like a householder.” And again the blessed Paul says,¹¹ “that we through patience and comfort of the Scriptures might have hope.” This he practiced above all men, being brought up in the law of his fathers, at the feet of Gamaliel, whence he would afterwards naturally apply to reading: for he who exhorted others would himself first follow the advice he gave.

Do you not see him continually appealing to the testimony of the prophets, and searching into their writings? And then — Paul gives attendance to reading (for it is no slight

⁷NPNF first adds “It is well said, ‘Thou shalt save thyself,’” rendering *καλῶς εἶπε, καὶ σεαυτὸν*, which Field reports as an addition (note p); it then puts “the words of sound doctrine” in quotation marks, as from 1 Tim 4:6. The Greek is Chrysostom’s own phrase and has no “sound.”

⁸The iota subscripts in *παρήνευσεν* and in *ἀναθυμούμεν* below are faint at the resolution of the scan; the standard spellings are printed.

⁹NPNF: “if such advice is addressed to him ... what shall be said to us?,” from the older editions (Field, note s).

¹⁰NPNF: “Christ also shows the duty of teachers, when He says, ‘The kingdom of heaven is like unto an householder ...,’” rendering the longer text of the older editions (Field, notes t, v).

¹¹NPNF: “And the blessed Paul gives the same advice,” from the older editions (Field, note w).

ἡμεῖς δὲ ῥαθυμοῦμεν;¹² «Ἵνα σου γὰρ ἡ προκοπὴ, φησὶ, φανερά ᾗ ἐν πᾶσιν.» Ὅρᾳς ὅτι ἐβούλετο αὐτὸν καὶ ἐν τούτῳ μέγαν γενέσθαι καὶ θαυμαστὸν, καὶ ὅτι ἐδεῖτο αὐτοῦ, φησὶν, ἔτι; «Ἵνα σου ἡ προκοπὴ φανερά ᾗ ἐν πᾶσι.» μὴ ἐν τῷ βίῳ μόνον, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἐν τῷ λόγῳ τῷ διδασκαλικῷ.

advantage that is to be reaped from the Scriptures), and are we idle?¹³ “That your profiting may appear,” he says, “to all.” Do you see that he would have him become great and admirable in this respect also, and that he still needed this?¹⁴ For he wished that his “profiting should appear” not only in his life, but in the word of teaching.

I.2 ON THE PRIESTHOOD 4.7–8

Chrysostom cites 1 Timothy 4:13 to show that a bishop must be skilled in the word, and he glosses it as attending “to the reading and to the Scriptures,” the pastor’s study ordered to teaching. He then shows that Paul lays the same duty on “the governed” (τοῖς ἀρχομένοις).¹⁵

[col. 670] Καὶ ὅτι μὲν πολλὴν αὐτὸς ἐποιεῖτο τοῦ μέρους τούτου σπουδὴν, ἐκ τούτων δὴ-
λον.

ἡ'. Ἄκουε δὲ καὶ τῷ μαθητῇ τί φησιν ἐπιστέλλων· *Πρόσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει, τῇ παρακλήσει, τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ.* Καὶ τὸν ἀπὸ τούτου καρπὸν προστίθησι λέγων· *Τούτο γὰρ ποιῶν καὶ σεαυτὸν σώσεις καὶ τοὺς ἀκούοντάς σου. Καὶ πάλιν· Δουλοῦν δὲ Κυρίου οὐ δεῖ μαχεσθαι, ἀλλ' ἡπιον εἶναι πρὸς πάντας, διδακτικόν, ἀνεξίκακον.* Καὶ προῖον δὲ φησὶ· *Σὺ δὲ μένε ἐν οἷς ἔμαθες καὶ ἐπιστεύθης, εἰδὼς παρὰ τίνος ἔμαθες, καὶ ὅτι ἀπὸ βρέφους τὰ ἱερὰ γράμματα οἶδας, τὰ δυνάμενά σε σοφί-
σαι εἰς σωτηρίαν.* Καὶ πάλιν· *Πᾶσα Γραφὴ θεόπνευστος, φησὶ, καὶ ὠφέλιμος πρὸς διδασκαλίαν, πρὸς ἔλεγχον, πρὸς ἐπανόρθωσιν, πρὸς παιδεύσιν τὴν ἐν δικαιοσύνῃ, ἵνα ἄρτι-
ος ᾗ ὁ τοῦ Θεοῦ ἄνθρωπος.*

From all this it is evident that St. Paul gave great diligence to this part of his work.¹⁶

8. Hear also what he says in his letter to his disciple: “Give heed to reading, to exhortation, to teaching,” and he adds the fruit of this, saying, “For in doing this you shall save both yourself and them that hear you.” And again he says, “The Lord’s servant must not strive, but be gentle towards all, apt to teach, forbearing;” and further on he says, “But abide in the things which you have learned, and that from a babe you have known the sacred writings which are able to make you wise unto salvation,” and again, “Every Scripture is inspired of

¹² So Field, as a question. MSS I and L read ῥαθυμῶμεν, “and are we to be idle?” (Field, note a).

¹³ NPNF continues, “But we are indolent, and we hear with carelessness and indifference. What punishment do we not deserve!” This renders καὶ παρέργως ἀκούομεν; καὶ πόσης οὐκ ἂν εἴημεν κολάσεως ἄξιοι;, which PG 62:566 prints and Field reports as an addition of the older editions (note a).

¹⁴ NPNF: “Thus he would have him appear ... showing that this was still necessary for him,” from the older editions (Field, note e).

¹⁵ Greek: PG 48:670–71 (*De sacerdotio* IV, the end of §7 and §8). English: NPNF¹ 9:68 (trans. W. R. W. Stephens), adapted.

¹⁶ NPNF: “had given himself to the study of which we have been speaking with great diligence and zeal.” The Greek, πολλὴν αὐτὸς ἐποιεῖτο τοῦ μέρους τούτου σπουδὴν, has no word for study; the “part” is skill in the word, the subject of §§6–7.

Ἄκουε δὲ καὶ τῷ Τίτῳ περὶ τῆς τῶν ἐπισκόπων καταστάσεως διαλεγόμενος τί προστίθῃσι· [col. 67i] Δεῖ γάρ, φησὶν, εἶναι τὸν ἐπίσκοπον ἀντεχόμενον τοῦ κατὰ τὴν διδασχὴν πιστοῦ λόγου, ἵνα δυνατὸς ᾖ καὶ τοὺς ἀντιλέγοντας ἐλέγχειν. Πῶς οὖν ιδιώτης τις ὢν, ὡς οὗτοί φασι, τοὺς ἀντιλέγοντας ἐλέγχειν δυνήσεται καὶ ἐπιστομίζειν; Τίς δὲ χρεια προσέχειν τῇ ἀναγνώσει καὶ ταῖς Γραφαῖς, εἰ ταύτην δεῖ τὴν ιδιωτείαν ἀσπάζεσθαι; Σκήψεις ταῦτα καὶ προφάσεις, καὶ ῥαθυμίας¹⁷ καὶ ὀκνου προσχήματα.

Ἀλλὰ τοῖς ἱερεῦσι, φησὶ, ταῦτα διατάττεται· καὶ γὰρ περὶ ἱερέων ἡμῖν ὁ λόγος νῦν. Ὅτι δὲ καὶ τοῖς ἀρχομένοις, ἄκουε τί πάλιν ἐτέροις ἐν ἐτέρῳ Ἐπιστολῇ παραινεῖ¹⁹. Ὁ λόγος τοῦ Χριστοῦ ἐνοικεῖτω ἐν ὑμῖν πλουσίως ἐν πάσῃ σοφίᾳ. Καὶ πάλιν· Ὁ λόγος ὑμῶν πάντοτε ἐν χάριτι ἀλατὶ ἡρτυμένος, εἰδέναι πῶς δεῖ ἐνὶ ἐκάστῳ ἀποκρίνεσθαι. Καὶ τὸ πρὸς ἀπολογίαν ἐτοίμους εἶναι ἅπασιν εἴρηται. Θεσσαλονικεῦσι δὲ ἐπιστέλλων, Οἰκοδομεῖτε, φησὶν, εἰς τὸν ἕνα, καθὼς καὶ ποιεῖτε. Ὅταν δὲ περὶ ἱερέων διαλέγηται, Οἱ καλῶς προεστώτες πρεσβύτεροι διπλῆς τιμῆς ἀξιούσθωσαν, μάλιστα οἱ κοπιῶντες ἐν λόγῳ καὶ διδασκαλίᾳ.

God, and is profitable for teaching, for reproof, for correction, for instruction which is in righteousness, that the man of God may be complete.”

Hear what he adds further in his directions to Titus about the appointment of bishops: “The bishop,” he says, “must be holding to the faithful word which is according to the teaching, that he may be able to convict the gainsayers.” But how shall anyone who is unskilled, as these men say, be able to convict the gainsayers and stop their mouths? Or what need is there to give heed to reading and to the Scriptures,¹⁸ if such a state of unskillfulness is to be welcomed? Such arguments are mere makeshifts and pretexts, the marks of idleness and sloth.

“But it is to the priests,” someone says, “that these charges are given.” Certainly, for our discourse now is about priests. But that they are given also to the governed, hear what again he urges on others in another epistle: “Let the word of Christ dwell in you richly in all wisdom,” and again, “Let your speech be always with grace, seasoned with salt, that you may know how you ought to answer each one.” And the charge to be ready to make a defence is given to all.²⁰ And writing to the Thessalonians he says, “Build each other up, even as also you do.” But when he speaks of priests, he says, “Let the elders that rule well be counted worthy of double honor, especially those who labor in the word and in teaching.”

¹⁷The iota subscript of ῥαθυμίας, and the breathings of ἐνὶ and εἰς below, are not clearly legible in Migne’s type; the standard forms are printed.

¹⁸NPNF adds “Holy”; the Greek has ταῖς Γραφαῖς.

¹⁹The page prints παραγεί, a misprint for παραινεί.

²⁰NPNF adds “of their faith”; the Greek is καὶ τὸ πρὸς ἀπολογίαν ἐτοίμους εἶναι ἅπασιν εἴρηται.

I.3 HOMILY 19 ON ACTS, §5

The nearest the Fathers come to joining 1 Timothy 4:13 to the church's lection. Chrysostom describes the deacon's bidding and the reader (ἀναγνώστης) beginning Isaiah before an inattentive congregation, and then cites the verse a fortiori: if even Timothy was told to attend to reading, the reading is never superfluous. The office and Timothy's ἀνάγνωσις stand in one paragraph, and he does not identify them.²¹

ε'. Ἀλλὰ φέρε ἐπὶ ὕβρεως τὸ πρᾶγμα ἐξετάσωμεν. Εἰ τις τὸν ὑβρίζοντα κατέχοι, καὶ ἐπιστομίῳ ὡς ἀλγῶν ταῖς ὕβρεσιν, ἕτερος δὲ μηδὲ φροντίζει μηδὲ προσποιεῖτο, τίς μᾶλλον καταφρονεῖ; οὐχ οὗτος; Ἐκεῖνος μὲν γὰρ ἐμφαίνει, ὅτι πληγὴν δέχεται· οὗτος δὲ μονονοῦχι τὸ στόμα ἐμφράττει τοῦ Θεοῦ. Ἐφρίξατε τὸ ῥηθὲν; Ἀλλ' ἄκουε καὶ πῶς τοῦτο γίνεταί. Τὸ στόμα, δι' οὗ ὁ Θεὸς φθέγγεται, στόμα ἐστὶ τοῦ Θεοῦ. Καθάπερ γὰρ τοῦτο τὸ στόμα τῆς ψυχῆς ἡμῶν ἐστὶ, καίτοι ψυχῆς οὐκ ἐχούσης στόμα· οὕτω καὶ τὸ στόμα τῶν προφητῶν στόμα ἐστὶ τοῦ Θεοῦ. Ἀκούσατε καὶ φρίξατε.

Κοινὸς διάκονος, ἔστηκεν ὁ διάκονος²³ μέγα βοῶν καὶ λέγων· *Πρόσχωμεν*· καὶ τοῦτο πολλάκις. Ἐκεῖνη ἡ φωνὴ κοινὴ τῆς Ἐκκλησίας ἐστίν, ἣν οὗτος ἀφήσι, καὶ οὐδεὶς ὁ προσέχων. Μετ' ἐκεῖνον ἄρχεται ὁ ἀναγνώστης τῆς προφητείας Ἡσαίου²⁴. καὶ οὐδὲ οὕτω προσέχει τις, καίτοι προφητεία οὐδὲν ἀνθρώπινον ἔχει. Εἴτα εἰς ἐπήκοον ἐκφωνεῖ λέγων, *Τάδε λέγει Κύριος*, καὶ οὐδὲ οὕτω προσέχει τις. Τί λέγω; Φοβερά τινα διεξέρχεται καὶ φρικώδη, καὶ οὐδὲ οὕτως ἔστι τις ὁ προσέχων.

Say — if we are to examine the matter as a case of insult — suppose one person checks the man insulting him and stops his mouth, as being hurt by the insults, and another person shows no concern and does not even pretend to notice: which shows the more contempt? Is it not the latter? For the former shows that he feels himself hit; the latter all but stops the mouth of God. Did you shudder at what was said? But hear how this comes about.²² The mouth by which God speaks is the mouth of God. Just as our mouth is the mouth of our soul, though the soul has no mouth, so the mouth of the Prophets is the mouth of God. Hear, and shudder.

There, common (to the whole congregation) stands the deacon crying aloud, and saying, “Let us attend,”²⁵ and this many times.²⁶ It is the common voice of the whole Church, the voice which he utters, and yet none attends. After him the Reader begins the prophecy of Isaiah, and still none attends, although prophecy has nothing of man in it. Then he cries out in the hearing of all,²⁷ “Thus says the Lord,” and still none attends. What am I saying?

²¹Greek: PG 60:156, §5 from its opening to the close of the argument. English: NPNF¹ 11:127 (rev. G. B. Stevens), adapted. The NPNF translation of Acts was made from the Oxford editors' reconstructed “old text” and does not always follow Migne.

²²Omitted in NPNF.

²³The breathing of ἔστηκεν is not legible on the scan; the standard perfect is printed. Κοινὸς διάκονος is odd Greek and may be corrupt.

²⁴The diacritic on the ι is blurred on the page.

²⁵NPNF: “Let us attend to the reading.” Migne has only Πρόσχωμεν, and NPNF's own note gives the bidding as Πρόσέχωμεν alone.

²⁶Omitted in NPNF.

²⁷NPNF: “Then after this, he says,” omitting εἰς ἐπήκοον ἐκφωνεῖ.

Ἀλλὰ τίς ὁ λόγος τῶν πολλῶν; Ἀεὶ, φησὶ, τὰ αὐτὰ ἀναγινώσκεται. Τοῦτο μάλιστα ὑμᾶς ἀπόλλυσιν. Εἰ μὲν οὖν ᾗδετε αὐτὰ, μάλιστα μὲν οὐδὲ οὕτως ἀπέχεσθαι ἔδει· ἐπεὶ καὶ ἐν τοῖς θεάτροις αἰεὶ τὰ αὐτὰ γίνεται, καὶ ὁμῶς οὐ λαμβάνετε κόρον. Ποῖα τὰ αὐτὰ τολμᾶς εἰπεῖν, ὁ μὴδὲ τῶν προφητῶν τὰ ὀνόματα εἰδώς; Οὐκ αἰσχύνῃ λέγων μὲν διὰ τοῦτο μὴ ἀκοῦειν, ἐπειδὴ τὰ αὐτὰ αἰεὶ ἀναγινώσκεται, οὐκ εἰδώς δὲ οὐδὲ τὰ ὀνόματα τῶν ἀναγινωσκομένων, καὶ ταῦτα αἰεὶ τὰ αὐτὰ ἀκούων; Καὶ γὰρ σὺ ὡμολόγησας, ὅτι τὰ αὐτὰ λέγεται. Ἐγὼ εἰ ἔλεγον εἰς κατηγορίαν προσφέρων τοῦτο, σὲ ἐχρῆν ἐφ' ἑτέραν ἀπολογίαν ἐλθεῖν, μὴ ἐπὶ τὴν κατηγορίαν τὴν σήν.

Εἰπέ μοι, σὺ οὐ παραινεῖς τῷ υἱῷ τῷ σῷ; Ἄν οὖν οὗτος εἴπῃ, ὅτι Ἀεὶ τὰ αὐτὰ, ἄρα οὐχ ἡγῆ ὑβριν εἶναι; Τότε ἐνὴν μὴ λέγειν τὰ αὐτὰ, ὅτε αὐτὰ καὶ ᾗδειμεν, καὶ διὰ τῶν ἔργων ἐπεδεικνύμεθα· μᾶλλον δὲ οὐδὲ τότε περιττὴ ἡ ἀνάγνωσις. Τί Τιμοθέου ἴσον; Ἀλλ' ὁμῶς καὶ ἐκεῖνῳ γράφων ὁ Παῦλος ἔλεγε· *Πρόσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει, τῇ παρακλήσει*.³⁰ Οὐ γὰρ ἔστιν, οὐκ ἔστιν ἐξαντληθῆναι ποτε τὸν νοῦν τῶν Γραφῶν· πηγὴ τίς ἐστιν οὐκ ἔχουσα πέρας.

He goes through things fearful and dreadful,²⁸ and even so there is no one who attends.

But what is the common excuse? “It is always the same things that are read.”²⁹ This it is most of all that ruins you. Suppose you knew the things; even so you certainly ought not to turn away, since in the theatres also the same things are always done, and still you take no disgust. How dare you talk about “the same things,” you who know not so much as the names of the Prophets? Are you not ashamed to say that this is why you do not listen, because “the same things are always read,” while you do not know even the names of what is read, and this though always hearing the same things? You have yourself confessed that the same things are said. Had I said this to accuse you, you ought to have found some other defence, not to have fallen back on the very charge against you.

Tell me, do you not exhort your son? Now if he should say, “Always the same things!” would you not count it an insult? It would be time enough not to say “the same things” when we both knew the things and exhibited them in our works. Or rather, even then the reading would not be superfluous. What is equal to Timothy?³¹ Yet even to him Paul wrote, “Give attention to reading, to exhortation.” For it is not, it is not possible ever to exhaust the sense of the Scriptures: it is a spring that has no end.

²⁸NPNF: “Then after this punishments and vengeance,” which does not render Migne’s *Τὶ λέγω; Φοβερά τινα διεξέρχεται καὶ φορικῶδη* and presumably follows the Oxford “old text.”

²⁹NPNF: “It is always the same things over again,” without the verb of reading, *ἀναγινώσκεται*.

³⁰Migne notes that one codex lacks *τῇ παρακλήσει*, as it lacks the words *ὅτι ... λέγεται* above.

³¹NPNF adds “tell me that.”

I.4 HOMILY 3 ON 2 THESSALONIANS, §4

Chrysostom's fullest account of why the public reading matters: the silence the deacon commands honours not the reader but God, who speaks to all through him, and the lections are "letters from heaven." Every public marker lies in the context (the reader standing up, the deacon, "Thus says the Lord," "here"), and 1 Timothy 4:13 is not cited.³²

δ'. Εἰπέ δὴ μοι, εἴ τις εἰς ἰατρῆον παραγένοιτο, καὶ μὴ χάριν αἰτεῖ τὸν ἰατρὸν, ἀλλὰ νομίζει³³ χαρίζεσθαι ἐκείνῳ, καὶ ἀφείς φάρμακον αἰτῆσαι ἐπὶ τὸ τραῦμα, περὶ ἱμάτια ἀσχολοῖτο, ἄρα ἀπέλθοι τι ἂν ὁ τοιοῦτος λαβῶν ἀγαθόν; Οὐκ ἔγωγε οἶμαι. Τὸ δὲ αἴτιον τούτων ἀπάντων, εἰ βούλεσθε, ἐρῶ· νομίζουσι πρὸς ἡμᾶς εἰσέναι, ὅταν εἰσίσωσιν ἐνταῦθα· νομίζουσι παρ' ἡμῶν ἀκούειν ἅπερ ἀκούουσιν· οὐ προσέχουσιν, οὐκ ἐννοοῦσιν ὅτι πρὸς τὸν Θεὸν εἰσέρχονται, ὅτι αὐτὸς αὐτοῖς διαλέγεται.

Ὅταν γὰρ ἀναστὰς ὁ ἀναγινώσκων λέγῃ, *Τάδε λέγει Κύριος*, καὶ ὁ διάκονος ἐστῶς³⁴ ἐπιστομίζῃ πάντας, οὐ τῷ ἀναγινώσκοντι τιμὴν ποιῶν τοῦτό φησιν, ἀλλὰ τῷ δι' ἐκείνου πᾶσι διαλεγομένῳ. Εἰ ᾗδεσαν ὅτι Θεὸς ἦν ὁ ταῦτα λέγων διὰ τοῦ προφήτου, πάντα ἂν τὸν τύφον ἔρριψαν. Εἰ γὰρ ἀρχόντων αὐτοῖς διαλεγομένων οὐκ ἀνέχονται ἔξω προσέχειν, πολλῷ μᾶλλον τοῦ Θεοῦ. Ἡμεῖς ὑπηρέται ἐσμέν, ἀγαπητοί· ἡμεῖς οὐ τὰ ἡμέτερα λέγομεν, ἀλλὰ τὰ τοῦ Θεοῦ· ἐπιστολαὶ καθ' ἐκάστην ἡμέραν ἀπὸ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ ἡκουσαι ἀναγινώσκονται.

Εἰπέ δὴ μοι, παρακαλῶ, εἴ τις ἄρτι παρόντων ἡμῶν πάντων εἰσῆλθεν ἔχων ζώνην χρυσοῦν, καὶ ἀνατεταμένος καὶ σοβῶν ἔφησε πεμφθῆναι παρὰ τοῦ βασιλέως τοῦ ἐπὶ τῆς γῆς, καὶ πρὸς τὴν πόλιν ἄπασαν τὴν

4. Tell me then, if anyone should go to the shop of a physician, and not ask a favor of the physician, but think that he was doing him a favor, and, declining to ask a medicine for his wound, should concern himself about his garments, would he go away having received any benefit? I think not. But, if you wish, I will tell you the cause of all these things. They think, when they enter here, that they enter into our presence; they think that what they hear they hear from us. They do not attend, they do not consider, that they are entering into the presence of God, that it is he who addresses them.

For when the Reader stands up and says, "Thus says the Lord," and the Deacon stands and imposes silence on all, he says this not to do honor to the Reader, but to him who speaks to all through him. If they knew that it was God who was saying these things through the prophet, they would cast away all their pride. For if, when rulers address them, they cannot bear to attend to anything else, much more when God speaks. We are servants, beloved; we speak not our own things, but the things of God. Letters that have come from heaven are read every day.

Tell me, I beg you, if now, when we are all present, someone entered wearing a golden girdle, drawing himself up and swaggering, and said that he was sent by the king on earth, and that he brought a

³²Greek: PG 62:484–85, the whole of §4 to the end of its argument. English: NPNF¹ 13:387–88, adapted.

³³Migne's note would read the optatives αἰτοῖ and νομίζοι; the page prints the indicatives.

³⁴The breathing is not clearly legible; the standard rough breathing is printed.

ἐπιστολὴν κομίζειν περί τινων ἀναγκαίων, ἄρα οὐκ ἂν ἅπαντες συνεστράφητε; ἄρα οὐκ ἂν καὶ τοῦ διακόνου μὴ παρακελευομένου πολλὴν παρείχετε τὴν σιγὴν; Ἐγὼ γε οἶμαι· καὶ γὰρ ἤκουσα ἐπιστολῶν βασιλέων ἀναγινωσκομένων ἐνταῦθα. Εἴτ' ἂν μὲν τις παρὰ βασιλέως ἦκη, πάντες προσέχετε· παρὰ δὲ τοῦ Θεοῦ ἦκει, καὶ ἐκ τῶν οὐρανῶν φθέγγεται ὁ προφήτης, καὶ οὐδεὶς ὁ προσέχων; Ἡ οὐ πιστεύετε, ὅτι παρὰ τοῦ Θεοῦ ταῦτα τὰ λεγόμενα; Ἐπιστολαὶ αὐταὶ εἰσι πεμφθεῖσαι παρὰ τοῦ Θεοῦ. Εἰσερχώμεθα τοίνυν μετὰ τῆς προσηκούσης τιμῆς εἰς τὰς ἐκκλησίας, καὶ μετὰ φόβου ἐπακούωμεν τῶν λεγομένων.

letter to the whole city concerning matters of importance, would you not all be turned towards him? Would you not, even without a command from the deacon, keep a profound silence? I think so. For I have heard letters from kings read here.³⁵ Then if anyone comes from a king, you all attend; but when the prophet comes from God and speaks from heaven, does no one attend? Or do you not believe that the things spoken are from God? These are letters sent from God. Let us therefore enter the churches with fitting reverence, and let us hearken with fear to the things spoken.³⁶

I.5 HOMILY II ON JOHN, §1

In one sentence Chrysostom uses the verb for the church's reading of the Sunday Gospel and for the layman's reading of the same passage at home. A page later the bare noun ἀνάγνωσις means the public lection, and only the adverb ἐνταῦθα, "here," says so. The context decides the sense, not the word.³⁷

α. Μίαν ὑμᾶς ἅπαντας αἰτῆσαι βούλομαι χάριν, πρὶν ἢ τῶν εὐαγγελικῶν ἄψασθαι ῥημάτων· ἀλλὰ μὴ ἀνανεύσητε πρὸς τὴν αἰτησιν. Οὐτε γὰρ βαρὺ τι καὶ ἐπαχθὲς αἰτῶ, οὔτ' ἐμοὶ τῷ λαμβάνοντι μόνον χρήσιμον ἔσται τὸ διδόμενον, ἀλλὰ καὶ ὑμῖν τοῖς παρέχουσι· καὶ τάχα πολλῶ πλεον ὑμῖν. Τί ποτ' οὖν ἐστιν ὅπερ αἰτοῦμαι ὑμᾶς; Κατὰ μίαν Σαββάτων, ἢ καὶ κατὰ Σάββατον, τὴν μέλλουσαν ἐν ὑμῖν ἀναγνωσθῆσθαι τῶν Εὐαγγελίων περικοπὴν, ταύτην πρὸ τούτων τῶν ἡμερῶν μετὰ χειρὸς λαμβάνων ἕκαστος οἶκοι καθήμενος ἀναγινωσκέτω συνεχῶς, καὶ πολλάκις περισκοπεῖτω μετὰ ἀκριβείας τὰ ἐγκείμενα, καὶ βασανίζετω ταῦτα καλῶς· καὶ τί μὲν σαφές, τί δὲ ἀδηλον, σημειούσθω.³⁸ τί δὲ αὐτῶν ἐναντίον εἶναι δοκοῦν, οὐκ ὅν δέ· καὶ πάντα ἀπλῶς δι-

1. I desire to ask one favor of you all, before I touch on the words of the Gospel; do not refuse my request, for I ask nothing heavy or burdensome, nor, if granted, will it be useful only to me who receive, but also to you who grant it, and perhaps far more so to you. What then is it that I require of you? That each of you take in hand that section (pericope) of the Gospels which is to be read among you on the first day of the week, or even on the Sabbath, and before those days arrive, that he sit down at home and read it again and again,³⁹ and often carefully consider its contents, and examine all its parts well; and let him mark what is clear and what obscure,⁴⁰ and what seems to be contradictory but is not;⁴¹ and when

³⁵NPNF adds "often"; the Greek has ἤκουσα alone.

³⁶NPNF adds "here"; the Greek is τῶν λεγομένων.

³⁷Greek: PG 59:77 (first excerpt) and 78 (second), from §1; the omitted stretch, about forty lines, answers the excuse of business. English: NPNF¹ 14:38 (trans. Charles Marriott), adapted.

³⁸Migne's note: Morel adds σημειούσθω; some read τί δὲ εὐδην for τί δὲ ἀδηλον.

ακωδωνίσαντες, οὕτως ἀπαντᾶτε πρὸς τὴν ἀκρόασιν. Οὐ γὰρ μικρὸν ἀπὸ τῆς τοιαύτης σπουδῆς καὶ ὑμῖν καὶ ἡμῖν ἔσται τὸ κέρδος.

[...]

Ἔστι καὶ ἑτέρα πρόφασις τοῖς οὕτω ῥαθυμοῖς³⁹ ἀλογωτάτη, τὸ μὴ κεκτηθῆαι μηδὲ ἔχειν βιβλία. Καὶ πρὸς μὲν τοὺς πλουτοῦντας, γέλως ὑπὲρ ταύτης ἡμᾶς ἀποτείνεσθαι τῆς προφάσεως· ἐπειδὴ δὲ τῶν πενεστέρων πολλοὺς οἶμαι κατακεχρηθῆαι αὐτῇ συνεχῶς, ἐκεῖνο ἂν ἡδέως ἐροίμην αὐτοὺς, εἰ μὴ πάντα τὰ τῆς τέχνης ὄργανα, ἧς ἑκαστός ἐστι δημιουργός, πλήρη καὶ ὁλόκληρα ἔχει, καὶ μυρία κωλύει πενία. Πῶς οὖν οὐκ ἄτοπον, ἐκεῖ μὲν μὴ αἰτιᾶσθαι πενίαν, ἀλλὰ πάντα πράττειν πρὸς τὸ μηδὲν γενέσθαι ἐμπόδιον μηδαμόθεν· μέλλοντας δὲ τοσαύτην ὠφέλειαν καρποῦσθαι, ἀσχολίαν ἀποδύρεσθαι καὶ πενίαν; Πλὴν ἀλλὰ καὶ εἴ τινες οὕτω πένητες εἶεν, ἔνεστιν ἐκ τῆς συνεχῆς ἐνταῦθα γινομένης ἀναγνώσεως μηδὲν ἀγνοεῖν τῶν ἐγκειμένων ἐν ταῖς θείαις Γραφαῖς. Εἰ δὲ ἀδύνατον ὑμῖν τοῦτο εἶναι δοκεῖ, εἰκότως τοῦτο δοκεῖ. Οὐδὲ γὰρ μετὰ πολλῆς πολλοὶ παραγίνονται τῆς προθυμίας τῶν λεγομένων ἀκροασόμενοι, ἀλλὰ αὐτὸ τοῦτο μόνον ἀφοσιωσάμενοι πρὸς τὴν ἡμέραν, εὐθέως ὑποστρέφουσιν οἴκαδε.

you have tried every point, in a word, so come to the hearing.⁴² For from zeal like this there will be no small gain both to you and to us.

[*the excuse of business, answered*]

There is another most foolish excuse of these sluggards: that they neither own nor have books. Now as to the rich, it is ludicrous that we should take our aim at this excuse; but because I imagine that many of the poorer sort continually use it, I would gladly ask them whether every one of them does not have all the instruments of the trade which he works at, full and complete, though infinite poverty stands in his way. Is it not then a strange thing, in that case to throw no blame on poverty, but to use every means that there be no obstacle from any quarter, but, when we might gain such great advantage, to lament our want of leisure and our poverty? Besides, even if any should be so poor, it is in their power, by means of the continual reading which takes place here, to be ignorant of nothing contained in the divine Scriptures.⁴⁴ Or if this seems to you impossible, it seems so with reason; for many do not come with fervent zeal to hearken to what is said, but having done this one thing for form's sake for the day,⁴⁵ immediately return home.

³⁹NPNF: "read it through," which does not render συνεχῶς.

⁴⁰NPNF omits σημειούσθω, though its own note gives "let him mark" as another reading.

⁴¹NPNF: "what seems to make for the adversaries, but does not really so," from another reading; its own note gives "to be contradictory" as the alternative.

⁴²NPNF: "so go to hear it read." The Greek, οὕτως ἀπαντᾶτε πρὸς τὴν ἀκρόασιν, has no word for reading; the "hearing" is the service with its sermon.

⁴³The iota subscript is not visible at the resolution of the scan; the standard spelling is printed.

⁴⁴NPNF: "by means of the continual reading of the holy Scriptures which takes place here, to be ignorant of nothing contained in them." The Greek gives the reading no object (ἐκ τῆς συνεχῆς ἐνταῦθα γινομένης ἀναγνώσεως); only ἐνταῦθα makes it public.

⁴⁵NPNF: "on our account," rendering Savile's πρὸς ἡμᾶς. Migne prints πρὸς τὴν ἡμέραν (his note d), which NPNF's own note gives as the alternative.

I.6 HOMILY 2 ON MATTHEW, §§5–6

Chrysostom will not leave “the reading of the divine Scriptures” (ἡ ἀνάγνωσις τῶν θείων γραφῶν) to the monks; the man with a wife and a household needs it more. Here ἀνάγνωσις is a layman’s own reading of Scripture, and the “let us all” of his comment on 4:13 (I.1) proves to be his standing counsel to the laity.⁴⁶

Τίς γάρ ὑμῶν, εἰπέ μοι, τῶν ἐνταυθα ἐστηκότων, ψαλμὸν ἕνα ἀπαιτηθεὶς εἰπεῖν δύναται ἂν⁴⁷, ἢ ἄλλο τι μέρος τῶν θείων γραφῶν; Οὐκ ἔστιν οὐδεὶς. Καὶ οὐ τοῦτο μόνον ἐστὶ τὸ δεινὸν, ἀλλ’ ὅτι πρὸς τὰ πνευματικὰ ἀναπεπτωκότες οὕτω, πρὸς τὰ σατανικὰ πυρὸς ἐστε σφοδρότεροι. Καὶ [p. 25] γὰρ εἰ βουληθεὶ τις ὑμᾶς ὥδᾶς ἐξετάσαι διαβολικὰς, καὶ πορνικὰ καὶ κατακεκλασμένα μέλη, πολλοὺς εὐρήσει μετὰ ἀκριβείας ταῦτα εἰδότας, καὶ μετὰ πολλῆς αὐτὰ ἀπαγγέλλοντας τῆς ἡδονῆς.

Ἀλλὰ τίς ἡ ἀπολογία τῶν ἐγκλημάτων; Οὐκ εἰμὶ, φησὶ, τῶν μοναχῶν, ἀλλὰ καὶ γυναῖκα ἔχω καὶ παιδία, καὶ οἰκία ἐπιμελοῦμαι. Τοῦτο γάρ ἐστιν ὃ πάντα ἐλυμήνατο, ὅτι ἐκεῖνοις μόνοις νομίζετε προσήκειν τὴν ἀνάγνωσιν τῶν θείων γραφῶν, πολλῶ πλεόν ἐκείνων ὑμεῖς δεόμενοι. Τοῖς γὰρ ἐν μέσῳ στρεφόμενοι, καὶ καθ’ ἐκάστην ἡμέραν τραύματα δεχομένοις, τούτοις μάλιστα δεῖ φαρμάκων. Ὡστε τοῦ μὴ ἀναγινώσκειν πολλῶ χεῖρον τὸ καὶ περιττὸν εἶναι τὸ πρᾶγμα νομίζειν· ταῦτα γὰρ σατανικῆς μελέτης τὰ ῥήματα.

Οὐκ ἀκούετε Παύλου λέγοντος, ὅτι «πρὸς νοουθεσίαν ἡμῶν ταῦτα πάντα ἐγράφη;» Σὺ δὲ, ἂν μὲν εὐαγγέλιον δεῖξασθαι δέῃ, χερσὶν ἀνίπτους οὐκ ἂν ἔλοιο τοῦτο ποιῆσαι· τὰ δὲ ἔνδον ἐγκείμενα οὐχ ἡγῆ σφόδρα ἀναγκαῖα εἶναι; Διὰ τοῦτο πάντα ἄνω καὶ κάτω γέγονεν. Εἰ γὰρ βούλει μαθεῖν ὅσον τῶν γραφῶν

For, tell me, who of you that stand here, if he were required, could repeat one psalm, or any other portion of the divine Scriptures? There is not one. And it is not this only that is the grievous thing, but that while you have become so slack with respect to things spiritual, yet in regard of what belongs to Satan you are more vehement than fire. Thus should anyone be minded to ask of you songs of devils and impure, effeminate melodies, he will find many that know these perfectly, and repeat them with much pleasure.

But what is the answer to these charges? “I am not,” you will say, “one of the monks, but I have both a wife and children, and the care of a household.” Why, this is what has ruined everything: your supposing that the reading of the divine Scriptures belongs to those only, when you need it much more than they. For those who are in the thick of the world, and each day receive wounds, these have most need of medicines. So that it is far worse than not reading, to think the thing even superfluous; for these are the words of a satanic schooling.

Do you not hear Paul saying, “that all these things are written for our admonition”? And you, if you had to take up a Gospel, would not choose to do so with unwashed hands; but the things that are laid up within it, do you not think them highly necessary? It is

⁴⁶Greek: Field, *Homiliae in Matthaeum* 1:24–25 (Cambridge, 1839), checked against PG 57:30–31, which reprints Field’s text and agrees with it in every word checked. Field’s quotation marks are shown as «». English: NPNF¹ 10:13 (trans. George Prevost, rev. M. B. Riddle, from Field’s text), adapted.

⁴⁷The accent on ἂν is not clear in Field’s type.

τὸ κέρδος, ἐξέτασον σεαυτὸν, τίς μὲν γίνῃ ψαλμῶν ἀκούων, τίς δὲ σατανικῆς ᾠδῆς· καὶ πῶς διάκεισαι ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ διατρίβων, καὶ πῶς ἐν θεάτρῳ καθήμενος· καὶ ὅψει πολὺ τὸ μέσον ταύτης ἀκείνης τῆς ψυχῆς, καί· τοιγε μίᾳς οὔσης. Διὰ τοῦτο Παῦλος ἔλεγε· «φθείρουσιν ἢ θη χρηστὰ ὁμιλίαι κακαί.» Διὰ τοῦτο συνεχῶν⁴⁸ ἡμῖν δεῖ τῶν ἀπὸ τοῦ πνεύματος ἐπωδῶν.

Καὶ γὰρ τοῦτό ἐστιν ὃ τῶν ἀλόγων πλεονεκτοῦμεν, ὡς τῶν γε ἄλλων ἔνεκεν καὶ σφόδρα αὐτῶν ἐλαττούμεθα. Τοῦτό ἐστι τροφή ψυχῆς, τοῦτο κόσμος, τοῦτο ἀσφάλεια· ὥσπερ οὖν τὸ μὴ ἀκούειν, λιμός καὶ φθορά· «δῶσω γὰρ, φησὶν, αὐτοῖς οὐ λιμὸν ἄρτου, οὐδὲ δίψαν ὕδατος, ἀλλὰ λιμὸν τοῦ ἀκοῦσαι λόγον κυρίου.» Τί γένοιτ' ἂν οὖν ἀθλιώτερον, ὅταν ὅπερ ὁ θεὸς ἐν τάξει κολάσεως ἀπειλῇ, τοῦτο αὐτομάτως σὺ κατὰ τῆς σαντοῦ κεφαλῆς ἔλκη⁴⁹ τὸ κακόν, λιμὸν τινα χαλεπὸν ἐπεισάγων τῇ ψυχῇ, καὶ πάντων αὐτὴν ἀσθενεστέραν ποιῶν; Ἀπὸ γὰρ λόγων καὶ φθείρεσθαι καὶ σώζεσθαι πέφυκε.

because of this that all things are turned upside down. For if you would learn how great is the profit of the Scriptures, examine yourself, what you become by hearing psalms, and what by listening to a song of Satan; and how you are disposed when staying in a church, and how when sitting in a theatre; and you will see that great is the difference between this soul and that, although both be one. Therefore Paul said, "Evil communications corrupt good manners." For this cause we have need continually of those songs which serve as charms from the Spirit.

Yes, it is by this that we excel the irrational creatures, since with respect to all other things we are even exceedingly inferior to them. This is the soul's food, this its ornament, this its security; even as not to hear is famine and wasting. "For I will give them," he says, "not a famine of bread, nor a thirst of water, but a famine of hearing the word of the Lord." What then can be more wretched, when the very evil which God threatens by way of punishment you draw of your own accord upon your own head, bringing into your soul a grievous famine, and making it the feeblest thing in the world? For it is its nature both to be corrupted and to be saved by words.

⁴⁸MSS A and An read συνεχώς (Field, note b).

⁴⁹Field prints σώζεσθαι below without iota subscript.

I.7 HOMILY 9 ON COLOSSIANS, §1

Expounding Colossians 3:16, Chrysostom tells men with wives and children that Paul commits the reading of the Scriptures “especially” to them, and bids them buy books, at least the New Testament, as their constant teachers. It is his most concrete word on reading at home, and it turns on the same question of laity and clergy as On the Priesthood (I.2).⁵⁰

αὐτὸς δὲ τί φησιν; Ὁ λόγος τοῦ Χριστοῦ ἐνοικεῖτω ἐν ὑμῖν πλουσίως· τοῦτέστιν, ἡ διδασκαλία, τὰ δόγματα, ἡ παραίνεσις, ἐν αἷς οὐδὲν τὴν παρούσαν ζωὴν εἶναι φησιν, οὐδὲ τὰ ταύτης ἀγαθὰ. Ἐὰν γὰρ ταῦτα ἴδωμεν, οὐδενὶ τῶν δυσχερῶν εἵξομεν⁵¹. Ἐνοικεῖτω, [col. 361] φησὶν, ἐν ὑμῖν πλουσίως, μὴ ἀπλῶς, ἀλλὰ μετὰ πολλῆς τῆς περιουσίας. Ἀκούσατε ὅσοι ἐστὲ κοσμικοὶ, καὶ γυναικὸς καὶ παιδῶν προΐστασθε, πῶς καὶ ὑμῖν ἐπιτρέπει μάλιστα τὰς Γραφὰς ἀναγινώσκειν· καὶ οὐχ ἀπλῶς οὐδὲ ὡς ἔτυχεν, ἀλλὰ μετὰ πολλῆς τῆς σπουδῆς.

[...]

Μηδὲ περιμείνης ἕτερον διδάσκαλον· ἔχεις τὰ λόγια τοῦ Θεοῦ· οὐδεὶς σε διδάσκει ὡς ἐκεῖνα. Οὗτος μὲν γὰρ πολλὰ καὶ διὰ κενοδοξίαν καὶ διὰ βασκανίαν ἐπικρύπτει πολλάκις. Ἀκούσατε, παρακαλῶ, πάντες οἱ βιωτικοὶ, καὶ κτᾶσθε βιβλία φάρμακα τῆς ψυχῆς. Εἰ μὴδὲν ἕτερον βούλεσθε, τὴν γοῦν Καινὴν κτήσασθε, τῶν ἀποστόλων τὰς Πράξεις, τὰ Εὐαγγέλια, διδασκάλους διηνεκεῖς. Ἄν λύπη συμβῇ, ὥσπερ εἰς ἀποθήκην φαρμάκων ἔγκυψον· λάβε παραμυθίαν ἐκείθεν τοῦ δεινοῦ, ἂν ζημία, ἂν θάνατος, ἂν ἀποβολὴ οἰκείων· μᾶλλον δὲ μὴ ἔγκυπτε, ἀλλὰ ἀνάλαβε πάντα, ἔχε ἐπὶ τῆς διανοίας. Τοῦτο πάντων αἴτιον τῶν κακῶν, τὸ μὴ εἰδέναι τὰς Γραφὰς. Χωρὶς ὅπλων [col. 362] εἰς πόλεμον βαδίζομεν· καὶ πῶς ἔδει σωθῆναι; Ἀγαπητὸν μετὰ τούτων σωθῆναι, μή τι γε χωρὶς τούτων. Μὴ τὰ πάντα ἐφ’ ἡμᾶς ῥί-

And what does he say? “Let the word of Christ dwell in you richly”; that is, the teaching, the doctrines, the exhortation, in which he says that the present life is nothing, nor yet its good things. If we see this, we shall yield to no hardship whatever. “Let it dwell in you,” he says, “richly,” not simply, but with great abundance. Hear, as many of you as are in the world and have the charge of wife and children, how to you too he commits especially the reading of the Scriptures; and that not lightly, nor in any casual way, but with much earnestness.

[...]

Do not wait for another to teach you; you have the oracles of God. No one teaches you as they do; for he often keeps back much out of vainglory and envy. Hear, I beg you, all you who are occupied with this life, and get yourselves books, medicines for the soul. If you will have nothing else, get at least the New Testament, the Acts of the Apostles, the Gospels, as your constant teachers.⁵² If grief befalls you, dip into them as into a chest of medicines; take from there comfort for your trouble, be it loss, or death, or the bereavement of your own; or rather, do not merely dip into them, but take them in whole; hold them in your mind. This is the cause of all evils: not knowing the Scriptures. We go into battle without arms, and how

⁵⁰Greek: PG 62:360–62; about forty-five lines are omitted between the two excerpts. English: NPNF¹ 13:300–01 (rev. J. A. Broadus), adapted.

⁵¹The accent on εἵξομεν, and the iota subscript in συμβῇ below, are heavy in Migne’s type; the standard forms are printed.

πετετε· πρόβατά ἐστε, ἀλλ' οὐκ ἄλογα, ἀλλὰ λογικά· πολλὰ καὶ ὑμῖν ὁ Παῦλος ἐπιτρέπει.

should we come off safe? We should be content to be safe with them, let alone without them. Do not throw everything on us! You are sheep, yet not without reason, but rational; Paul commits much to you also.

I.8 THE HOMILY ON ISAIAH 45:7, §3

The preacher names the day's lections by their content, "the woman with the issue of blood was read," with a bare passive verb that has no object, no place, and no reader; the public sense comes from the sentence before, "the things read to us today." Migne notes that the homily stands in all the editions on the authority of a single Bavarian manuscript, and its ascription to Chrysostom was not examined for this edition.⁵³

[col. 145] γ.⁵⁴ Ἀλλὰ ταῦτα μὲν ἐκ τῶν προοιμίων ἅπαντα εἰπεῖν ἐξέβημεν· ἐπειδὴ δὲ τῶν σήμερον ἡμῖν ἀναγνωσθέντων τινὰ πολλοὺς τῶν οὐ προσεχόντων ἴσως ἐθορύβησε, [col. 146] καὶ τῶν ἀπειρώς Γραφὰς ἐχόντων, φέρε δὴ, πολλῇ τῇ ρύμῃ πρὸς ταῦτα χωρῆσωμεν.

Ἀνεγνώσθη μὲν γὰρ καὶ ἡ αἰμορρόουσα, ἡ τῇ ἀφῆ⁵⁵ τὰς πηγὰς τῶν αἱμάτων στήσασα, καὶ τῇ τῆς πίστεως δυνάμει τοσοῦτον συλήσασα θησαυρόν· καὶ γὰρ ἦν κλοπὴ τὸ γινόμενον· ἀλλὰ καὶ κλοπὴ εὐδοκιμοῦσα, καὶ ἡ συλήσασα μετὰ τὸν ἔλεγχον ἐπαινουμένη. Αὐτὸς γὰρ ὁ συληθεὶς Ἰησοῦς ἀνακηρύττει τὸ γύναιον· Ἀνεγνώσθη καὶ τὰ στίγματα Παύλου, τὰ τραύματα, τὰ δεσμωτήρια, αἱ ἀπαγαγαί, τὰ ναυάγια, τὰ δεσμὰ, αἱ ἀλύσεις, αἱ ἐπιβουλαὶ αἱ ποικίλαι καὶ διηκεκεῖς, οἱ θάνατοι οἱ καθημερινοὶ, ὁ λιμὸς, τὸ δίψος, ἡ γυμνότης, ἡ ἐπισύστασις ἡ καθημέραν.

3. But we have strayed into saying all this by way of preface. Since, however, some of the things read to us today have perhaps troubled many of those who were not paying attention, and of those who are unpractised in the Scriptures, come now, let us make for them at full speed.

For the woman with the issue of blood was read, she who by a touch stopped the fountains of her blood, and by the power of faith carried off so great a treasure by stealth. For what happened was a theft; but a theft that won praise, and she who stole it was commended after she was found out. For Jesus himself, the one robbed, proclaims the little woman aloud. The marks of Paul were read too: the wounds, the prisons, the arrests, the shipwrecks, the bonds, the chains, the plots of every kind and without end, the daily deaths, the hunger, the thirst, the nakedness, the pressure of every day.

⁵²NPNF: "get you at least the New Testament, the Apostolic Epistles, the Acts, the Gospels." The Greek names no separate "Apostolic Epistles": τὴν γοῦν Καινὴν κτήσασθε, τῶν ἀποστόλων τὰς Πράξεις, τὰ Εὐαγγέλια.

⁵³Greek: PG 56:145–46, *In illud: Ego Dominus Deus feci lumen*, §3, from its opening to the turn to the text of Isaiah. Migne's note: "Ad unius quippe codicis Bavarici fidem haec homilia in omnibus editionibus habetur." English: trans. editor; no published English translation was found.

⁵⁴The last three lines of col. 145 run into the binding. The ends of εἰπεῖν, ἀναγνωσθέντων and ἐθορύβησε are only partly visible and are completed from the letters that remain, the hyphenation, and col. 146.

⁵⁵The breathing is not clearly legible; the rough breathing is printed.

Ἀλλὰ τί πάθω; Ἀνάγκη φυγεῖν πολλῇ τῇ σφοδρότητι χρησάμενον, μὴ πάλιν ὁ Παῦλος κατασχών, ἀπαγάγη τοῦ προκειμένου. Καὶ γὰρ ἴστε, πολλάκις ἐτέρωθί με βαδίζοντα καὶ τετραμμένον ἀπαντήσας ἐν μέσῳ τῷ λόγῳ κατέσχε, καὶ οὕτως εἶλεν, ὥς ἐν αὐτῷ πείσαι καταλύσαι τὸν λόγον. "Ἰν' οὖν μὴ καὶ σήμερον τοῦτο πάθωμεν, καθάπερ χαλινὸν ἐκέῖσε φερόμενῳ⁵⁶ τῷ λόγῳ μετὰ πολλῆς τῆς σφοδρότητος ἐμβالόντες, οὕτως αὐτὸν ἐλκύσωμεν, καὶ ἐπὶ τὴν προφητικὴν ἀγάγωμεν ῥῆσιν.

But what am I to do? I must flee, and with all my force, lest Paul lay hold of me again and carry me away from the subject before us. For you know that often, when I was walking elsewhere and headed in another direction, he has met me in the middle of my sermon, held me fast, and so taken me captive that he persuaded me to end my sermon in him. So that this does not happen to us today as well, let us throw a bridle with all our force on the sermon as it bolts off that way, and so draw it back and lead it to the prophet's text.

⁵⁶Savile printed φερόμενον; φερόμενῳ is his marginal conjecture, which Fronto Ducaeus put into the text (Migne, note a).

PART II

The Greek Commentators on 4:13

II.1 THE COISLIN CATENA ON 4:13: THE UNATTRIBUTED SCHOLION

The oldest catena comment on the verse, printed by Cramer from a single Paris manuscript, abridges Chrysostom (I.1): the reading is “that of the divine writings, obviously.” The noun is defined by its content, and it is exhortation, not reading, that is directed “toward one another.”⁵⁷

¹³ Ἔως ἔρχομαι, πρόσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει, τῇ παρακλήσει, τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ.

Ὅρα, πῶς αὐτὸν παραμυθεῖται· εἰκὸς γὰρ αὐτὸν ἀπορφανισθέντα ζητεῖν αὐτόν.⁵⁸ “πρόσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει,” τῇ τῶν θείων [p. 36] γραφῶν δηλονότι;⁵⁹ τῇ παρακλήσει τῇ πρὸς ἀλλήλους, τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ.

¹³ “Till I come, attend to reading, to exhortation, to teaching.”

See how he consoles him; for it was natural that he, orphaned, should miss him. “Attend to reading”: that is, to the reading of the divine writings, obviously; to exhortation, the exhortation toward one another; to teaching.

II.2 THEODORE OF MOPSUESTIA ON 4:13

Theodore (d. 428) defines teaching and exhortation, and it is exhortation, not reading, that he places “in public” (ἐπὶ τοῦ κοινού), though chiefly in conversation with one person at a time. The Greek is a catena fragment that has lost the opening of his comment; the Latin version, given in the note, shows that he began with the reading and made it Timothy’s instruction of himself.⁶⁰

ΘΕΟΔΩΡΟΣ. Διδασκαλίαν φησὶ τὴν ἀπό-
λυτον ἐξήγησιν, παράκλησιν δὲ τὴν ἀπό-
τινῶν συμβεβηκότων νουθεσίαν τε καὶ ὑπό-
μνησιν, ἣν ἐνίοτε μὲν, καὶ ἐπὶ τοῦ κοινού
γίνεσθαι ἀνάγκη, μάλιστα δὲ καὶ ἐν ταῖς

Theodore. By “teaching” he means exposition pure and simple; by “exhortation,” the admonition and reminding that arise from particular events, which must sometimes take place in public as well, but most of all in conversations with one person at a time.

⁵⁷ Greek: Cramer, *Catena* 7:35–36, from Paris, Coislin 204. The volume’s title page is dated 1844, the section title page 1843. English: trans. editor.

⁵⁸ The catena has the second αὐτόν, which Field adds to Chrysostom’s text (I.1) from four manuscripts “and the catena.”

⁵⁹ So the page, with the Greek question mark; almost certainly a misprint for the raised point. The translation reads a pause.

⁶⁰ Greek: Cramer, *Catena* 7:36, lines 3–6. Swete prints the same fragment (2:149), citing Coislin 204, f. 203a, without the name (which it gives in its apparatus); it differs otherwise only in movable ν, punctuation and quotation marks, and in the accent of μάλιστα. Latin: Swete 2:148–49. English: trans. editor.

πρὸς τὸν καθ' ἑνα διαλέξεσι.⁶¹

II.3 THEODORE OF MOPSUESTIA ON 3:12–13: THE READERS

A control. Five pages before its comment on 4:13 the same catena uses the same noun for the liturgical act: of the lower clergy, “some carry out the reading” (οἱ μὲν τὴν ἀνάγνωσιν ἐκτελοῦσιν). The catena knew the public sense and did not use it at 4:13.⁶²

¹² Τέκνων καλῶς προϊστάμενοι, καὶ τῶν ἰδίων οἴκων. ¹³ οἱ γὰρ καλῶς διακονήσαντες βαθμὸν ἑαυτοῖς καλὸν περιποιούνται, καὶ πολλὴν παρρησίαν ἐν πίστει τῇ ἐν Χριστῷ Ἰησοῦ.

Πανταχοῦ τίθησι τὴν τῶν τέκνων προστασίαν, ἵνα μὴ ἀπὸ τούτου οἱ λοιποὶ σκανδαλίζονται. “οἱ γὰρ καλῶς,” φησὶ, “διακονήσαντες βαθμὸν ἑαυτοῖς καλὸν περιποιούνται,” τουτέστι, προκοπὴν, “καὶ παρρησίαν πολλὴν τὴν ἐν πίστει,” οἱ ἐν τοῖς κάτω δεῖξαντες ἑαυτοὺς διεγгерμένους, ταχέως καὶ πρὸς ἐκεῖνα ἀνελεύσονται, φησὶν.

ΘΕΟΔΩΡΟΥ. Ἐκεῖνο δὲ προσθεῖναι ἄξιον ὅτι μὴ δεῖ θαυμάζειν, εἰ μήτε [ὑπὸ] διακόνων⁶³ ἐμνήσθη, μήτε ἀναγνωστών. τῶν γὰρ ἐν τῇ τῆς ἐκκλησίας λειτουργίᾳ βαθμῶν ἔξωθεν μᾶλλον οὗτοί εἰσι, διὰ τὴν χρεῖαν ἐπινοηθέντες ὕστερον, ἣν διὰ τὸ τῶν πεπιστευκότων πλῆθος λοιπὸν δι' ἐτέρων πληροῦσθαι ἡναγκάσθη. ὅθεν οὐδὲ νεό-

¹² “Managing their children and their own households well. ¹³ For those who have served well as deacons gain a good standing for themselves, and great boldness in the faith that is in Christ Jesus.”

He everywhere lays down the management of children, so that the rest may not be scandalized on this account. “For those who have served well as deacons,” he says, “gain a good standing for themselves,” that is, advancement, “and great boldness in the faith”: those who have shown themselves wide awake in the lower offices will quickly go up to those higher ones too, he says.

Theodore's. This too is worth adding: that one should not be surprised if he made mention neither of subdeacons nor of readers. For these stand rather outside the grades in the church's liturgy, having been devised later on account of need, a need which, because of the multitude of believers, had thereafter to

⁶¹Theodore's comment survives entire only in the Latin version, and the Latin begins with the reading (Swete 2:148–49): *usque dum ueniens, intende lectioni, [exhortationi,] doctrinae. 'et sollicitudinem impende erga lectiones, ut discere possis quae te et facere et alios docere conueniat; ut assiduitate lectionum teipsum instruens, insistere possis doctrinae et exhortationi.* “Until I come, attend to reading, [to exhortation,] to teaching.” “And spend your care on the readings, so that you may learn what is fitting for you both to do and to teach others; so that, instructing yourself by assiduous reading, you may be able to persevere in teaching and exhortation.” The Latin then gives the definitions of teaching and exhortation that the Greek preserves; the manuscripts are confused at that point, and Swete restores the sentence from the Greek. *Lectiones* is plural, and its purpose clause makes the reading Timothy's own study.

⁶²Greek: Cramer, *Catenae* 7:30, lines 3–21: the lemma of 3:12–13, an unattributed scholion, and Theodore's. Swete 2:132–33 prints Theodore's fragment with the Latin, which has *alii quidem eorum lectionum officium implet*, “some of them fulfil the office of the readings,” and cites Coislin 204, f. 200b. English: trans. editor.

⁶³Cramer brackets ὑπὸ. Swete reports ὑπὸ διακόνων as the reading of the codex's first hand and prints ὑποδιακόνων; the Latin has *subdiaconum*. “Subdeacons” is the manuscript's reading.

μισται αὐτοὺς πρὸ τοῦ θυσιαστηρίου τὴν χειροτονίαν δέχεσθαι, ἐπεὶ μηδὲ αὐτῷ ὑπηρετοῦνται τῷ μυστηρίῳ, ἀλλ' οἱ μὲν τὴν ἀνάγνωσιν ἐκτελοῦσιν, οἱ δὲ ἔνδον τὰ πρὸς τὴν τῶν διακόνων ὑπηρεσίαν εὐτρεπίζουσιν, ἐπιμελόμενοι καὶ τῶν ἐκκλησιαστικῶν φώτων.

be met through others. Hence it is not even the custom for them to receive ordination before the altar, since they do not serve the mystery itself; but some of them carry out the reading, while the others, inside, make ready what belongs to the deacons' service, and also take care of the church's lamps.

II.4 THEODORET, INTERPRETATION OF I TIMOTHY, ON 4:13

*Theodoret (d. c. 460) reads the command as a lesson in effort: if Timothy, spiritual as he was, had to attend to reading, we too must bring our labour and so receive the Spirit's grace. He defines exhortation and teaching by what they do to their hearers, and he gives the reading no hearers at all.*⁶⁴

ιγ'. «Ἔως ἔρχομαι πρόσσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει, τῇ παρακλήσει, τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ.» Καὶ ἐντεῦθεν ἔστι μαθεῖν, ὡς καὶ ἡμᾶς προσήκει συνεισφέρειν τὸν πόνον, καὶ οὕτω λαμβάνειν τὴν χάριν τοῦ Πνεύματος. Καὶ γὰρ τῷ τρισμακαρίῳ Τιμοθέῳ πνευματικῶς ὄντι τῇ ἀναγνώσει προσέχειν ἐκέλευσεν ὁ διδάσκαλος. Παράκλησις δὲ, διδασκαλίας διαφέρει· τῷ τὴν μὲν διδασκαλίαν ἀκωλύτως⁶⁵ διάφορα προσφέρειν παιδεύματα· τὴν δὲ παράκλησιν ἢ τοὺς ἀθυμοῦντας ψυχαγωγεῖν, ἢ τοὺς ὀργιζομένους ταῖς συμβουλαῖς μεταβάλλειν.

¹³ “Until I come, attend to reading, to exhortation, to teaching.” From this too one may learn that we also must contribute our share of labour, and so receive the grace of the Spirit. For the teacher commanded the thrice-blessed Timothy, spiritual as he was, to attend to reading. Exhortation differs from teaching in this: teaching sets out a variety of instruction without restriction, while exhortation either comforts the downcast or, by counsel, changes the angry.

II.5 PSEUDO-OECUMENIUS ON 4:13

The Pauline commentary printed under the name of Oecumenius of Tricca is a catena-commentary of disputed authorship and date, usually placed in the late ninth or the tenth century. It puts the people into the verse, but on exhortation, “the exhortation toward the people” (πρὸς τὸν λαόν); the reading is the consolation of the Scriptures, and a duty for all: “if Timothy is commanded to read, what must we do?”⁶⁶

«Ἔως ἔρχομαι πρόσσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει.» Εἰκὸς ἦν αὐτὸν ἀπορφανισθέντα τοῦ Παύλου, ζητεῖν αὐτόν. Δισσῶς οὖν αὐτὸν παραμυθεῖ-

“Until I come, attend to reading.” It was natural that he, orphaned of Paul, should miss him. So he consoles him in two ways: with the promise of his arrival, and

⁶⁴Greek: PG 82:816 (Migne's Latin facing, col. 815). English: trans. editor.

⁶⁵So the page, “without hindrance.” Migne's Latin has *absolute*, and Swete conjectures ἀπολύτως, “without qualification,” the word of Theodore's own definition (II.2: ἀπόλυτον ἐξήγησιν). The translation “without restriction” serves either reading.

⁶⁶Greek: PG 119:172 (Migne's Latin facing, col. 171), from the lemma of 4:13 to the first comment on 4:14. The catenist never takes up τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ as a lemma. English: trans. editor.

ται, τῇ τε τῆς ἀφίξεως ἐπαγγελίᾳ.⁶⁷ καὶ τῇ ἐκ τῶν Γραμῶν [sic]⁶⁸ παραμυθίᾳ. Ὅρα δὲ, εἰ Τιμόθεος ἀναγινώσκειν ἐπιτάσσεται, τί δεῖ ποιεῖν ἡμᾶς; « Τῇ παρακλήσει. » Τῇ πρὸς τὸν λαόν. « Μὴ ἀμέλει τοῦ ἐν σοὶ χαρίσμα-τος, » τουτέστι, τῆς διδασκαλίας, ἢ τῆς ἐπισκοπῆς. Χάρις γὰρ Θεοῦ, τὸ ποιμένα εὐρε-θῆναι⁶⁹ τὸν νέον.

with the consolation that comes from the Scriptures. And see: if Timothy is commanded to read, what must we do? “To exhortation”: the exhortation toward the people. “Do not neglect the gift that is in you,” that is, the gift of teaching, or of the episcopate. For it was God’s grace that the young man was found a shepherd.

II.6 THEOPHYLACT OF OHRID, EXPOSITION OF I TIMOTHY, ON 4:13

Theophylact, archbishop of Ohrid from c. 1090, keeps Chrysostom’s gloss and paraphrases the command: “Until I come, read the Scriptures, and from them you will have, as far as is possible, the laws.” Reading stands in for the absent teacher; exhortation and teaching are each given their bearers, and reading is given none.⁷⁰

Ἔως ἔρχομαι πρόσσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει. Εἰ Τιμόθεον κελεύει προσέχειν τῇ ἀναγνώσει τῶν θείων Γραφῶν, τί λοιπὸν ἡμᾶς χρή ποιεῖν; Καὶ αὐτὸς δὲ Παῦλος ἄχρι τέλους προσεῖχεν ἂν πάντως ταύτῃ, ὅς γε τοῖς ἄλλοις παρήνει.⁷¹ Παραμυθεῖται δὲ αὐτὸν διὰ τοῦ εἰπεῖν, Ἔως οὐ ἔρχομαι, ἐλπίδας δούς⁷² ὅτι ὄψεται τὸν διδάσκαλον. Εἰκὸς γὰρ αὐτὸν ἀπορφανισθέντα ζητεῖν τὸν Παῦλον. Τί-νος δὲ ἔνεκεν εἶπεν, Ἔως ἔρχομαι; Ἐπειδὴ εἰκὸς ἦν αὐτὸν νέον ὄντα πολλὰ ἀγνοεῖν, καὶ δεῖσθαι τῆς παρουσίας⁷³ τοῦ Παύλου πρὸς τὸ μαθεῖν ταῦτα, φησίν. Ἔως ἔρχομαι ἀναγίνωσκε τὰς Γραφάς, κάκειθεν ἔξεις, ὡς ἔνεστι, τὰς νομοθεσίας. Ἐπειδὴ δὲ ἔλθω, ἐγὼ σοι ὑποθήσομαι τὰ λοιπά.

“Until I come, attend to reading.” If he commands Timothy to attend to the reading of the divine Scriptures, what then must we do? And Paul himself would surely have attended to it to the end, he who urged it on others. He consoles him by saying “Until I come,” giving him hope that he will see his teacher; for it was natural that he, orphaned, should miss Paul. And why did he say “Until I come”? Because it was likely that he, being young, did not know many things and needed Paul’s presence in order to learn them, he says: Until I come, read the Scriptures, and from them you will have, as far as is possible, the laws. When I come, I will set the rest before you.

Τῇ παρακλήσει. Τῇ πρὸς τοὺς λευπημέ-νους, ἢ καὶ ἄλλους ἐκλελυμένως ἔχοντας.

“To exhortation”: the exhortation directed to those who grieve, or to others

⁶⁷The page prints a full stop, but lower-case καὶ follows and Migne’s Latin runs on; the translation reads a comma.

⁶⁸Γραμῶν is not a word; read Γραφῶν, as the sense and Migne’s Latin (*a Scripturis*) require.

⁶⁹The breathing is not clearly legible; the standard rough breathing is printed.

⁷⁰Greek: PG 125:60 (Migne’s Latin facing, col. 59). English: trans. editor.

⁷¹The iota subscript of παρήνει is not clearly visible; the standard form is printed.

⁷²Migne records the variant διδούς ᾗξεν τὸν δ. for δούς ὅτι ὄψεται τὸν διδάσκαλον: “giving [hope] that the teacher will come.”

⁷³The final sigma is malformed on the page and looks like a question mark; the genitive after δεῖσθαι requires παρουσίας. In the second Ἔως οὐ ἔρχομαι above, the ρ is broken.

*Τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ. Τῇ πρὸς πάντας ἀπλῶς, καὶ
περὶ παντὸς πράγματος.*

who have grown slack.

“To teaching”: the teaching directed to all without distinction, and about every matter.

PART III

What the Word Means: Context Decides

III.1 SIRACH, THE PROLOGUE

The pre-Christian witness to the word. Ben Sira's grandson, who came to Egypt "in the thirty-eighth year" of Euergetes (usually reckoned 132 B.C.), uses the word-family three times, and each time of books studied: the readers who must become learned, his grandfather's ἀνάγνωσις of the law and the prophets, and the reader of the translation, asked "to make the reading with goodwill and attention" (μετ' εὐνοίας καὶ προσοχής). The genitive names what was read; the context of learners and a translated book decides the sense, and no assembly is named anywhere.⁷⁴

ΠΟΛΛΩΝ καὶ μεγάλων ἡμῖν διὰ τοῦ νόμου καὶ τῶν προφητῶν καὶ τῶν ἄλλων τῶν κατ' αὐτοὺς ἠκολουθηκότων δεδομένων, ὑπὲρ ὧν δέον ἐστὶν ἐπαινεῖν τὸν Ἰσραὴλ παιδείας καὶ σοφίας· καὶ ὡς οὐ μόνον αὐτοὺς τοὺς ἀναγινώσκοντας δέον ἐστὶν ἐπιστήμονας γίνεσθαι, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῖς ἐκτὸς δύνασθαι τοὺς φιλομαθοῦντας χρησίμους εἶναι καὶ λέγοντας καὶ γράφοντας· ὁ πάππος μου Ἰησοῦς ἐπὶ πλεῖον ἑαυτὸν δοὺς εἰς τε τὴν τοῦ νόμου καὶ τῶν προφητῶν καὶ τῶν ἄλλων πατρίων βιβλίῳ ἀνάγνωσιν, καὶ ἐν τούτοις ἱκανὴν ἔξιν περιποιησάμενος, προήχθη καὶ αὐτὸς συγγράψαι τι τῶν εἰς παιδείαν καὶ σοφίαν ἀνηκόντων, ὅπως οἱ φιλομαθεῖς καὶ τούτων ἔνοχοι γενόμενοι πολλῶ μᾶλλον ἐπιπροσθῶσιν διὰ τῆς ἐννόμου βιώσεως.

παρακέκλησθε οὖν μετ' εὐνοίας καὶ προσοχῆς τὴν ἀνάγνωσιν ποιεῖσθαι,⁷⁵ καὶ συγγνώμην ἔχειν ἐφ' οἷς ἂν δοκῶμεν τῶν κατὰ τὴν ἐρμηνείαν πεφιλοπονημένων τισὶν τῶν λέ-

Whereas many and great things have been delivered unto us by the law and the prophets, and by others that have followed after them, for the which things Israel ought to be commended for learning and wisdom; and whereas not only the readers themselves must needs become skilful, but also they that desire to learn must be able to profit them which are without, both by speaking and by writing: my grandfather Jesus, when he had given himself more and more to the reading of the law and the prophets and the other books of our fathers, and had gotten therein a good proficiency, was drawn on also himself to write something pertaining to learning and wisdom; to the intent that those which are desirous to learn, and are devoted to these things, might profit much more by living according to the law.

You are urged, therefore, to make the reading with goodwill and attention,⁷⁷ and to pardon us wherever we may seem, in some of the phrases, to come short in

⁷⁴Greek: Swete, *Old Testament in Greek* 2:644 (2nd ed., 1896), the whole prologue, text of Codex Vaticanus (B). The three uses stand at Swete's lines 4, 7 and 11; BDAG cites the second and third as lines 10 and 17 in Rahlfs's numbering. No manuscript in Swete's apparatus varies ἀναγινώσκοντας or ἀνάγνωσιν. English: the Authorized Version of 1611 as reprinted by Brenton (1851), adapted.

⁷⁵Codex B itself spells the infinitive ποιείσθε; Swete prints ποιείσθαι.

ξεων ἀδυναμείν· οὐ γὰρ ἰσοδυναμεῖ αὐτὰ ἐν ἑαυτοῖς Ἑβραϊστί⁷⁶ λεγόμενα καὶ ὅταν μεταχθῇ εἰς ἑτέραν γλῶσσαν· οὐ μόνον δὲ ταῦτα, ἀλλὰ καὶ αὐτὸς ὁ νόμος καὶ αἱ προφητεῖαι καὶ τὰ λοιπὰ τῶν βιβλίων οὐ μικρὰν ἔχει τὴν διαφορὰν ἐν ἑαυτοῖς λεγόμενα.

ἐν γὰρ τῷ ὀγδῶ καὶ τριακοστῷ ἔτει ἐπὶ τοῦ Εὐεργέτου βασιλείῳ παραγεννηθεὶς εἰς Αἴγυπτον καὶ συγχρονίσας, εὗρον οὐ μικρὰς παιδείας ἀφόμοιον. ἀναγκαιοτάτον ἐθέμην αὐτὸς προσενέγκασθαι τινα σπουδὴν καὶ φιλοπονίαν τοῦ μεθερμηνεύσαι τήνδε τὴν βίβλον· πολλὴν γὰρ ἀγρυπνίαν καὶ ἐπιστήμην προσενεγκάμενος ἐν τῷ διαστήματι τοῦ χρόνου πρὸς τὸ ἐπὶ πέρας ἄγοντα τὸ βιβλίον ἐκδόσθαι καὶ τοῖς ἐν τῇ παροικίᾳ βουλομένοις φιλομαθεῖν, προκατασκευαζομένους τὰ ἥθη ἐν νόμῳ βιοτεύειν.

what we have laboured to interpret; for the same things uttered in Hebrew, and translated into another tongue, have not the same force in them. And not only these things, but the law itself, and the prophecies, and the rest of the books, have no small difference when they are spoken in their own language.

For in the eight and thirtieth year, coming into Egypt in the reign of King Euergetes, and continuing there some time, I found a copy of no small learning.⁷⁸ I thought it most necessary⁷⁹ for me to bestow some diligence and travail to interpret this book; for, using great watchfulness and skill in that space of time to bring the book to an end, I have set it forth also for them which in the sojourning are willing to learn, being prepared before in manners to live after the law.

III.2 2 CLEMENT 18.1–19.1

In the homily transmitted as 2 Clement, usually dated about the middle of the second century, the verb is public, and the context says so: brothers and sisters addressed as present, “I read to you,” “him that reads among you,” and a place after “the God of truth,” which Lightfoot takes as the Scripture just heard. The homily also has 1 Timothy’s construction, προσέχειν with the dative, of hearers attending to what is read, and it is printed here as evidence against too narrow a reading of that idiom. What makes it public are the audience words ὑμῖν and ἐν ὑμῖν; no such word stands beside τῇ ἀναγνώσει in 1 Timothy 4:13.⁸⁰

XVIII. Καὶ ἡμεῖς οὖν γενώμεθα ἐκ τῶν εὐχαριστούντων, τῶν δεδουλεγκότων τῷ Θεῷ, καὶ μὴ ἐκ τῶν κρινομένων ἀσεβῶν. καὶ γὰρ αὐτὸς πανθαμαρτωλὸς ὢν καὶ μήπω φυγὼν τὸν πειρασμόν, ἀλλ’ ἔτι ὢν ἐν [p. 257] μέσοις τοῖς ὀργάνοις τοῦ διαβόλου, σπουδάζω τὴν δικαιοσύνην διώκειν, ὅπως ἰσχύσω κἂν ἐγ-

18. Therefore let us also be found among those that give thanks, among those that have served God, and not among the ungodly that are judged. For I myself too, being an utter sinner and not yet escaped from temptation, but being still amidst the engines of the devil, do my diligence

⁷⁶ So the page, with a smooth breathing and no diaeresis; the dictionaries print Ἑβραϊστί.

⁷⁷ AV and Brenton: “Wherefore let me intreat you to read it with favour and attention.” The Greek is passive and keeps the noun, τὴν ἀνάγνωσιν ποιέσθαι, “to make the reading.”

⁷⁸ AV and Brenton: “a book.” ἀφόμοιον is obscure (literally “a likeness, a copy”), and its sense is disputed.

⁷⁹ AV and Brenton: “therefore I thought it most necessary.” The “therefore” answers to the οὖν that N and C add; B, and so Swete’s text, has no connective.

⁸⁰ Greek: Lightfoot, *Apostolic Fathers* I.2:256–58 (London, 1890). English: Lightfoot’s translation in the same volume, p. 315, adapted.

γὺς αὐτῆς γενέσθαι, φοβούμενος τὴν κρίσιν τὴν μέλλουσαν.

XIX. Ὡστε, ἀδελφοὶ καὶ ἀδελφαί, μετὰ τὸν Θεὸν τῆς ἀληθείας⁸¹ ἀναγινώσκω ὑμῖν ἔντευξιν⁸² εἰς τὸ προσέχειν τοῖς γεγραμμένοις, ἵνα καὶ ἑαυτοὺς σώσητε καὶ τὸν ἀναγινώσκοντα ἐν ὑμῖν.⁸³ μισθὸν γὰρ αἰτῶ ὑμᾶς τὸ μετανοῆσαι ἐξ ὅλης καρδίας, σωτηρίαν ἑαυτοῖς καὶ ζωὴν διδόντας. τοῦτο γὰρ ποιήσαντες σκοποῦν πᾶσιν [p. 258] τοῖς νέοις θήσομεν τοῖς βουλομένοις περὶ τὴν εὐσέβειαν καὶ τὴν χρηστότητα τοῦ Θεοῦ φιλοπονεῖν.

to follow after righteousness, that I may prevail so far at least as to come near unto it, while I fear the judgment to come.

19. Therefore, brothers and sisters, after the God of truth [has been heard],⁸⁴ I read to you an appeal to the end that you may give heed to the things which are written, so that you may save both yourselves and him that reads among you. For I ask of you as a reward that you repent with your whole heart, giving salvation and life to yourselves. For by doing this we shall set a goal for all the young who desire to take pains over⁸⁵ piety and the goodness of God.

III.3 CYRIL OF JERUSALEM, CATECHESIS 4.33, 35–36

Cyril uses the one verb for the catechumen's reading and for the church's, and each time a phrase in the context tells the hearer which he means: "by yourself" (κατὰ σαυτόν) for the one, "in the church" (ἐν Ἐκκλησίᾳ, ἐν ἐκκλησίαις) for the other. In the last sentence of §36 both markers stand in one clause, because the verb alone could not tell them apart, and what the churches read decides what the individual may read.⁸⁶

ΠΕΡΙ ΤΩΝ ΘΕΙΩΝ ΓΡΑΦΩΝ.

ΛΓ'. Ταῦτα δὲ διδάσκουσιν ἡμᾶς αἱ θεόπνευστοι [col. 496] Γραφαὶ τῆς Παλαιᾶς τε καὶ Καινῆς Διαθήκης. Εἷς γάρ ἐστιν ὁ τῶν δύο Διαθηκῶν Θεός, ὁ τὸν ἐν τῇ Καινῇ φανέντα Χριστὸν, ἐν τῇ Παλαιᾷ προκαταγγείλας· ὁ διὰ νόμου καὶ προφητῶν εἰς Χριστὸν παιδαγωγῆσας. Πρὸ γὰρ τοῦ ἔλθεῖν τὴν πίστιν, ὑπὸ νόμον ἐφρουρούμεθα· καὶ, Ὁ νόμος παιδαγωγὸς ἡμῶν γέγονεν εἰς Χριστόν. Κἄν

OF THE DIVINE SCRIPTURES.

33. Now these the divinely-inspired Scriptures of both the Old and the New Testament teach us. For the God of the two Testaments is One, Who in the Old Testament foretold the Christ Who appeared in the New; Who by the Law and the Prophets led us to Christ's school. For *before faith came, we were kept in ward under the law, and, the law*

⁸¹The phrase is disputed: Zahn and Donaldson propose λόγον for Θεόν, and Gebhardt τόνων or τόνου. Lightfoot defends the text and, with Bryennios, explains it as "after you have heard the voice of God in the Scriptures" (I.2:195 n. 1, 257).

⁸²Lightfoot: "'appeal' 'entreaty'." The Syriac glosses it *supplicationem, id est, admonitionem*.

⁸³The Syriac version reads *me qui lego vobis verba* (or *oracula*) *dei*, "me, who read to you the words of God": its translator took the reader to be the preacher himself. Lightfoot makes the preacher the leading minister of the church, but he does not say in so many words that the preacher is ὁ ἀναγινώσκων.

⁸⁴Lightfoot: "after the God of truth hath been heard." The words in brackets are his supplement; the Greek has only μετὰ τὸν Θεὸν τῆς ἀληθείας.

⁸⁵Lightfoot: "who desire to toil in the study of piety." "The study of" is not in the Greek. Lightfoot's own note on φιλοπονεῖν cites the Sirach prologue's *πεφιλοπονημένων* (III.1).

⁸⁶Greek: PG 33:493–501; on these leaves the Greek alternates between the columns (493, 496, 497, 500, 501). §34, on the translation of the Seventy, is omitted. English: NPNF² 7:26–28 (trans. E. H. Gifford), adapted.

ποτε τῶν αἵρετικῶν ἀκούσης τινὸς βλασφημοῦντος νόμον ἢ προφήτας, ἀντίφθεγξαι τὴν σωτήριον φωνήν, λέγων. Οὐκ ἦλθεν Ἰησοῦς καταλῦσαι τὸν νόμον, ἀλλὰ πληρῶσαι. Καὶ φιλομαθῶς ἐπίγνωνθι, καὶ παρὰ τῆς Ἐκκλησίας, ποῖαι μὲν εἰσιν αἱ τῆς Παλαιᾶς Διαθήκης βίβλοι, ποῖαι δὲ τῆς Καινῆς. Καί μοι μηδὲν τῶν ἀποκρύφων ἀναγίνωσκε· ὁ γὰρ τὰ παρὰ πᾶσιν ὁμολογούμενα μὴ εἰδὼς, τί περὶ τὰ ἀμφιβαλλόμενα ταλαιπωρεῖς μάτην; Ἀναγίνωσκε⁸⁷ τὰς θείας Γραφάς, τὰς εἴκοσι δύο βίβλους τῆς Παλαιᾶς Διαθήκης ταύτας, τὰς ὑπὸ τῶν ἐβδομήκοντα δύο Ἑρμηνευτῶν ἐρμηνευθείσας.

[§ 34, the translation of the Seventy, omitted]

[col. 497] ΔΕ'. Τούτων τὰς εἴκοσι δύο βίβλους ἀναγίνωσκε, πρὸς δὲ τὰ ἀπόκρυφα μηδὲν ἔχε κοινόν. Ταύτας μόνας μελέτα σπουδαίως, ὡς καὶ ἐν Ἐκκλησίᾳ μετὰ παρρησίας ἀναγινώσκομεν. Πολύ σου φρονιμώτεροι, καὶ εὐλαβέστεροι⁸⁸ ἦσαν οἱ ἀπόστολοι, καὶ οἱ ἀρχαῖοι ἐπίσκοποι, οἱ τῆς Ἐκκλησίας προστάται, οἱ ταύτας παραδόντες. Σὺ οὖν, τέκνον τῆς Ἐκκλησίας ὦν μὴ παραχάραττε τοὺς θεσμούς.

Καὶ τῆς μὲν [col. 500] Παλαιᾶς⁸⁹ Διαθήκης, ὡς εἴρηται, τὰς εἴκοσι δύο μελέτα βίβλους, ὡς, εἰ φιλομαθῆς τυγχάνεις, ἐμοῦ λέγοντος, ὀνομαστί μεμνήσθαι σπούδασον. Τοῦ νόμου μὲν γάρ εἰσιν αἱ Μωσέως πρῶται πέντε βίβλοι, Γένεσις, Ἔξοδος, Λευϊτικόν⁹⁰, Ἀριθμοί, Δευτερονόμιον. Ἐξῆς δὲ, Ἰησοῦς υἱὸς Ναυῆ· καὶ τὸ τῶν Κριτῶν μετὰ τῆς Ρούθ

has been our tutor to bring us unto Christ. And if ever you hear any of the heretics speaking evil of the Law or the Prophets, answer in the sound of the Saviour's voice, saying, *Jesus came not to destroy the Law, but to fulfil it.* Learn also diligently, and from the Church, what are the books of the Old Testament, and what those of the New. And, pray, read none of the apocryphal writings: for why do you, who do not know those which are acknowledged among all, trouble yourself in vain about those which are disputed? Read the Divine Scriptures, these twenty-two books of the Old Testament, that have been translated by the Seventy-two Interpreters.

[§ 34 omitted]

35. Of these read the two and twenty books, but have nothing to do with the apocryphal writings. Study earnestly these only which we read openly in the Church. Far wiser and more pious than you were the Apostles, and the bishops of old time, the presidents of the Church who handed down these books. Being therefore a child of the Church, do not trench upon its statutes.

And of the Old Testament, as we have said, study the two and twenty books, which, if you are desirous of learning, strive to remember by name, as I recite them. For of the Law the books of Moses are the first five, Genesis, Exodus, Leviticus, Numbers, Deuteronomy. And next, Joshua the son of Nave, and the

⁸⁷The Ottobonianus manuscript has before this, as a title in larger letters, Ἀναγινώσκετε τὰς θείας Γραφάς, τὰς κβ' βίβλους. Migne's editor conjectures that Cyril held a codex of the Bible in his hand and showed it to his hearers, and perhaps read out the names of the books from its index at §35 (note 3).

⁸⁸Added by the editor from the manuscripts (Migne's note 7 on col. 497).

⁸⁹PG misprints Παλαιάς, with the circumflex on the ι.

⁹⁰Uncertain on the scan: the mark on the ι of Λευϊτικόν (a circumflex, or a diaeresis), the breathings of Ὡβ and Τερεμίου, and the diacritic of Ἡσαίου. Where the page is unclear, the standard forms are printed.

βιβλίον ἔβδομον ἀριθμούμενον. Τῶν δὲ λοιπῶν ἱστορικῶν βιβλίων, ἡ πρώτη καὶ ἡ δεύτερα τῶν Βασιλειῶν, μία παρ' Ἑβραίοις ἐστὶ βίβλος· μία δὲ, καὶ ἡ τρίτη καὶ ἡ τετάρτη. Ὁμοίως δὲ παρ' αὐτοῖς καὶ τῶν Παραλειπομένων ἡ πρώτη καὶ ἡ δεύτερα, μία τυγχάνει βίβλος· καὶ τοῦ Ἑσδρα ἡ πρώτη καὶ ἡ δεύτερα, μία λελόγισται· δωδεκάτη βίβλος ἡ Ἑσθήρ. Καὶ τὰ μὲν ἱστορικὰ ταῦτα. Τὰ δὲ στιχηρὰ τυγχάνει πέντε, Ἰὼβ, καὶ βίβλος Ψαλμῶν, καὶ Παροιμίαι, καὶ Ἐκκλησιαστής, καὶ Ἄσμα ἁσμάτων ἐπτακαίδεκατον βιβλίον. Ἐπὶ δὲ τούτοις τὰ προφητικά πέντε· τῶν δώδεκα προφητῶν μία βίβλος, καὶ Ἡσαΐου μία, καὶ Ἱερεμίου μία μετὰ Βαρούχ, καὶ Θρήνων, καὶ Ἐπιστολῆς· εἴτα Ἰεζεκιήλ· καὶ ἡ τοῦ Δανιήλ, εἰκοστὴ· δεύτερα βίβλος τῆς Παλαιᾶς Διαθήκης.

ΛΣ'. Τῆς δὲ Καινῆς Διαθήκης, τὰ τέσσαρα μόνον Εὐαγγέλια· τὰ δὲ λοιπὰ ψευδεπίγραφα καὶ βλαβερὰ τυγχάνει. Ἐγραψαν καὶ Μανιχαῖοι κατὰ Θωμᾶν Εὐαγγέλιον, ὅπερ, εὐωδία τῆς εὐαγγελικῆς προσωνυμίας ἐπι κεχρωσμένοι, διαφθείρει τὰς ψυχὰς τῶν ἀπλουστέρων. Δέχου δὲ καὶ τὰς Πράξεις τῶν δώδεκα ἀποστόλων· πρὸς τούτοις δὲ καὶ τὰς ἐπτὰ, Ἰακώβου, καὶ Πέτρου, Ἰωάννου, καὶ Ἰούδα καθολικὰς Ἐπιστολάς· ἐπισφράγισμα δὲ τῶν πάντων, καὶ μαθητῶν τὸ τελευταῖον, τὰς Παύλου δεκατέσσαρας Ἐπιστολάς. Τὰ δὲ λοιπὰ πάντα, ἕξω⁹¹ κείσθω ἐν δευτέρῳ· καὶ ὅσα [col. 501] μὲν ἐν ἐκκλησίαις μὴ ἀναγινώσκειται, ταῦτα μὴδὲ κατὰ σαυτὸν ἀναγίνωσκε, καθὼς ἤκουσας. Καὶ περὶ μὲν τούτων ταῦτα.

book of Judges, including Ruth, counted as seventh. And of the other historical books, the first and second books of the Kings are among the Hebrews one book; also the third and fourth one book. And in like manner, the first and second of Chronicles are with them one book; and the first and second of Esdras are counted one. Esther is the twelfth book; and these are the Historical writings. But those which are written in verses are five, Job, and the book of Psalms, and Proverbs, and Ecclesiastes, and the Song of Songs, which is the seventeenth book. And after these come the five Prophetic books: of the Twelve Prophets one book, of Isaiah one, of Jeremiah one, including Baruch and Lamentations and the Epistle; then Ezekiel, and the Book of Daniel, the twenty-second of the Old Testament.

36. Then of the New Testament there are the four Gospels only, for the rest have false titles and are mischievous. The Manichæans also wrote a Gospel according to Thomas, which being tintured with the fragrance of the evangelic title corrupts the souls of the simple sort. Receive also the Acts of the Twelve Apostles; and in addition to these the seven Catholic Epistles of James, Peter, John, and Jude; and as a seal upon them all, and the last work of the disciples, the fourteen Epistles of Paul. But let all the rest be put aside in a secondary rank. And whatever books are not read in the churches, these do not read even by yourself, as you have heard.⁹² Thus much of these subjects.

⁹¹ἕξω is missing in several manuscripts (Coislin, Ottobonianus, Roe, Casaubon, Grodeck; Migne's note 7 on col. 500). The editor keeps it and takes ἐν δευτέρῳ to mean not "in second place" only but "in no place."

⁹²NPNF: "as thou hast heard me say." "Me say" is not in the Greek (καθὼς ἤκουσας).

III.4 THE SYNOD OF LAODICEA, CANONS 15–17, 23–24, 59–60

Here the word-family is public throughout, and each canon says why: it names the assembly (ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ, ἐν ταῖς συναῖξεσι) or the office (ἀναγνώσται). Canon 17 uses the noun of 1 Timothy 4:13 for a reading between the psalms “in the congregations,” and canon 59 says what may be “said” in church (λέγεσθαι), not read. Canon 60, the list of books “that must be read,” is of doubtful genuineness: it is missing from Dionysius Exiguus, John Scholasticus, and Martin of Braga.⁹³

XV. Περὶ τοῦ μὴ δεῖν πλεον τῶν κανονικῶν ψαλτῶν, τῶν ἐπὶ τὸν ἄμβωνα ἀναβαινόντων καὶ ἀπὸ διφθέρας ψαλλόντων, ἐτέρους τινὰς ψάλλειν ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ.

XVI. Περὶ τοῦ ἐν σαββάτῳ εὐαγγέλια μετὰ ἐτέρων γραφῶν ἀναγινώσκεισθαι.

XVII. Περὶ τοῦ μὴ δεῖν ἐπισυνάπτειν ἐν ταῖς συναῖξεσι τοὺς ψαλμοὺς, ἀλλὰ διὰ μέσου καθ' ἕκαστον ψαλμὸν γίνεσθαι ἀνάγνωσιν.

XXIII. Ὅτι οὐ δεῖ ἀναγνώστας ἢ ψάλλτας ὥρᾳριον φορεῖν καὶ οὕτως ἀναγινώσκειν ἢ ψάλλειν.

XXIV. Ὅτι οὐ δεῖ ἱερατικούς ἀπὸ πρεσβυτέρων ἕως διακόνων καὶ ἐξῆς τῆς ἐκκλησιαστικῆς τάξεως ἕως ὑπηρετῶν ἢ ἀναγνωστῶν ἢ ψαλτῶν ἢ ἐπορκιστῶν ἢ θυρωρῶν ἢ τοῦ τάγματος τῶν ἀσκητῶν εἰς καπηλείον εἰσιέναι.

LIX. Ὅτι οὐ δεῖ ἰδιωτικούς ψαλμοὺς λέγεσθαι ἐν τῇ ἐκκλησίᾳ οὐδὲ ἀκανόνιστα βιβλία, ἀλλὰ μόνὰ τὰ κανονικὰ τῆς καινῆς καὶ παλαιᾶς διαθήκης.

LX. Ὅσα δεῖ βιβλία ἀναγινώσκεισθαι τῆς παλαιᾶς διαθήκης· α'. Γένεσις κόσμου. β'. Ἔξοδος ἐξ Αἰγύπτου. γ'. Λευιτικόν. δ'. Ἀριθμοί. ε'. Δευτερονόμιον. ζ'. Ἰησοῦς Ναυῆ. ζ'. Κριταί, Ρούθ. η'. Ἑσθέρ. θ'. Βασιλειῶν πρώτη καὶ δευτέρα. ι'. Βασιλειῶν τρίτη καὶ

15. No others shall sing in the Church, save only the canonical singers, who go up into the ambo and sing from a book.

16. The Gospels are to be read on the Sabbath, with the other Scriptures.

17. The Psalms are not to be joined together in the congregations, but a reading shall intervene after every psalm.

23. Readers and singers must not wear an orarium, and so read or sing.

24. No one of the priesthood, from presbyters to deacons, and so on in the ecclesiastical order to subdeacons, readers, singers, exorcists, door-keepers, or any of the class of the Ascetics, ought to enter a tavern.

59. No psalms composed by private individuals nor any uncanonical books may be said⁹⁴ in the church, but only the Canonical Books of the New and Old Testaments.⁹⁵

60. [This canon is of most questionable genuineness.]⁹⁸ These are the books of the Old Testament that must be read:⁹⁹ 1, Genesis of the world; 2, The Exodus from Egypt; 3, Leviticus; 4, Numbers; 5, Deuteronomy; 6, Joshua, the son of

⁹³Greek: Lauchert, *Kanones* (1896), pp. 74, 75, 78–79, a reprint without apparatus of the text of Mansi (II 563–574) and Bruns. The date of the synod is uncertain; NPNF gives A.D. 343–381. English: NPNF² 14:132–33, 143–44, 158–59 (ed. H. R. Percival), adapted.

⁹⁴NPNF: “may be read.” The Greek is λέγεσθαι, “said,” not a verb of reading.

⁹⁵NPNF: “of the Old and New Testaments.” Lauchert’s text has τῆς καινῆς καὶ παλαιᾶς διαθήκης, New before Old; other printed texts have the usual order.

τετάρτη. ια'. Παραλειπόμενα πρῶτον καὶ δεύτερον. ιβ'. Ἐσδρας πρῶτον καὶ δεύτερον. ιγ'. Βίβλος Ψαλμῶν ἑκατὸν πενήκοντα. ιδ'. Παροιμίαι Σολομῶντος. ιε'. Ἐκκλησιαστής. ις'. Αἷσμα ἁσμάτων.⁹⁶ ιζ'. Ἰώβ. ιη'. Δώδεκα προφήται. ιθ'. Ἡσαΐας. κ'. Ἱερεμίας καὶ Βαρούχ, Θρηνοί⁹⁷ καὶ ἐπιστολαί. κα'. Ἰεζεκιήλ. κβ'. Δανιήλ.

Τὰ δὲ τῆς καινῆς διαθήκης ταῦτα. Εὐ-αγγέλια τέσσαρα, κατὰ Ματθαῖον, κατὰ Μάρκον, κατὰ Λουκᾶν, κατὰ Ἰωάννην. Πράξεις ἀποστόλων. Ἐπιστολαὶ καθολικαὶ ἑπτὰ οὕτως· Ἰακώβου μία, Πέτρου δύο, Ἰωάννου τρεῖς, Ἰούδα μία. Ἐπιστολαὶ Παύλου δεκατέσσαρες· πρὸς Ῥωμαίους μία, πρὸς Κορινθίους [p. 79] δύο, πρὸς Γαλάτας μία, πρὸς Ἐφεσίους μία, πρὸς Φιλιππησίους μία, πρὸς Κολοσσαεῖς μία, πρὸς Θεσσαλονικεῖς δύο, πρὸς Ἑβραίους μία, πρὸς Τιμόθεον δύο, πρὸς Τίτον μία, πρὸς Φιλήμονα μία.

Nun; 7, Judges, Ruth; 8, Esther; 9, Of the Kings, First and Second; 10, Of the Kings, Third and Fourth; 11, Chronicles, First and Second; 12, Esdras, First and Second; 13, The Book of Psalms, a hundred and fifty;¹⁰⁰ 14, The Proverbs of Solomon; 15, Ecclesiastes; 16, The Song of Songs; 17, Job; 18, The Twelve Prophets; 19, Isaiah; 20, Jeremiah and Baruch, the Lamentations and the Epistles;¹⁰¹ 21, Ezekiel; 22, Daniel.

And these are the books of the New Testament: Four Gospels, according to Matthew, Mark, Luke and John; The Acts of the Apostles; Seven Catholic Epistles, to wit, one of James, two of Peter, three of John, one of Jude; Fourteen Epistles of Paul, one to the Romans, two to the Corinthians, one to the Galatians, one to the Ephesians, one to the Philippians, one to the Colossians, two to the Thessalonians, one to the Hebrews, two to Timothy, one to Titus, and one to Philemon.

III.5 BASIL, LETTER 217, CANONS 69–70

The infinitive εἰς τὸ ἀναγινώσκειν, with no object and no audience, means to exercise the reader's office. Its subject, the office-title Ἀναγνώστης, fixes the sense, and so does the language of clerical discipline around it: suspension, readmission, promotion withheld. The same infinitive that meant a catechumen's study in Cyril (III.3) means a cleric's duty here.¹⁰²

ΞΘ'. Ἀναγνώστης, εἰ τῇ ἑαυτοῦ μνηστῇ πρὸ τοῦ γάμου συναλλάξειεν, ἐνιαυτὸν ἀρ-

69. A Reader who has intercourse with his own betrothed before marriage shall,

⁹⁶ Αἷσμα: so the page, a capital with iota adscript and circumflex. Before Ψαλμῶν (no. 13) the page has a stray mark like a low comma, a printing flaw.

⁹⁷ Lauchert misprints Θρηνοί.

⁹⁸ Percival's note. Canon 60 is missing from Dionysius Exiguus, from John Scholasticus, and from Martin of Braga, who has canon 59 (NPNF² 14:159, after Hefele). Lauchert (p. XXIII) reports that Spittler, Fuchs and Herbst contested its genuineness, that Hefele defended it, and that Zahn has again declared it decidedly a later addition. It stands in the Greek text of Mansi and Bruns.

⁹⁹ NPNF: "These are all the books of Old Testament appointed to be read." "All" and "appointed" are not in the Greek ("Ὅσα δὲ βιβλία ἀναγινώσκεσθαι").

¹⁰⁰ Omitted in NPNF.

¹⁰¹ NPNF: "the Epistle," the singular its readers would expect; Lauchert's text has the plural ἐπιστολαί.

¹⁰² Greek: PG 32:800C–801A (canon 69) and 801 (canon 70), the third canonical letter to Amphilocheus. English: NPNF² 8:257 (trans. Blomfield Jackson), adapted.

γήσας, εἰς τὸ ἀναγινώσκειν δεχθήσεται, μένων ἀπρόκοπος. Κλεψιγαμήσας [col. 801] δὲ ἄνεν μνηστείας, παυθήσεται τῆς ὑπηρεσίας. Τὸ αὐτὸ καὶ ὑπηρετής.¹⁰³

Ο'. Διάκονος ἐν χεῖλεσι μιανθείς καὶ μέχρι τούτου ἡμαρτηκέναι ὁμολογήσας, τῆς λειτουργίας ἐπισχεθήσεται· τοῦ δὲ μετέχειν τῶν ἁγιασμάτων¹⁰⁵ μετὰ τῶν διακόνων ἄξιωθήσεται. Τὸ δὲ αὐτὸ καὶ πρεσβύτερος. Εἰ δέ τι τούτου πλεῖον φωραθείη τις ἡμαρτηκῶς, ἐν οἷῳ ἂν ᾗ βαθμῶ, καθαιρεθήσεται.

after a year's suspension, be received back to reading, remaining without advancement. If he has had secret intercourse without betrothal, he shall cease from his ministry. So too the minister.¹⁰⁴

70. The deacon who has been polluted in lips, and has confessed that he sinned to that extent, shall be removed from his ministry. But he shall be permitted to partake of the holy things together with the deacons. The same holds good in the case of a presbyter. If any one be detected in a more serious sin, whatever be his grade, he shall be deposed.

III.6 EUTHALIUS, PROLOGUE TO ACTS AND THE LIST OF LESSONS

The Euthalian apparatus, of disputed date (fourth to seventh century), uses the word in three senses within a few columns: the reader's study (ἡ τῆς ἀναγνώσεως χρηστομαθῆς πραγματεία, "the learning-loving business of reading"), a clear reading aloud (ἀναγνῶναι κατὰ προσφῶδιον, πρὸς εὐσημον ἀνάγνωσιν), and a numbered lesson (ἀναγνώσεις εἶσιν ἰς'). The division into lessons is expressed by διείλον, "I divided," not by the verb of reading, and Zacagni notes that the list of lessons is found only in the Regio-Alexandrinus codex.¹⁰⁶

Καθάπερ γὰρ ἂν τις ἀγχίνους χειροτέχνης τὸ κάλλιστον τῆς τέχνης εὐρόμενος, τὸ λεπτότερον δ' αὖθις ἐξ αὐτῆς περιεργάζεται λοιπόν, καὶ ζητῇ, μυρίαὶ αἰεὶ μηχαναῖς τὴν ἑαυτοῦ αὐτὸς ἐννοίαν πρὸς τὸ τελειότερον συνεκτίνων [sic]¹⁰⁷ τε καὶ ἄρμολόμενος· τὸν αὐτὸν δὴ τρόπον ἡμῖν καὶ ἡ τῆς ἀναγνώσεως τυγχάνει χρηστομαθῆς πραγματεία, ὅσημέραι πρὸς θεωρίαν τῆς τῶν καλῶν γνώσεως κατὰ μικρὸν τὴν ψυχὴν ἐξασκοῦσά τε καὶ ἀναβιβάζουσα.

Τοῖος τοιγαροῦν φιλόλογος ἄγαν ὑπάρχων

For just as a clever craftsman, once he has found the finest point of his art, goes on to work out something subtler from it, and searches, always by countless devices stretching and fitting his own idea toward greater perfection, in the same way, for us too, the learning-loving business of reading trains the soul day by day and raises it little by little to the contemplation of the knowledge of good things.

Being, then, a great lover of learning in

¹⁰³Migne's note 24 (the Benedictine editors): the view of Aristenus, that the "minister" is any cleric appointed without the laying on of hands, "seems less probable"; it is "far better" to understand the subdeacon. The editors add that the minister, "just like the lector," is given as a penalty that he be advanced no higher.

¹⁰⁴NPNF's note says that the Benedictine editors approve the view of Aristenus. Migne's note says the opposite (see the note on the Greek).

¹⁰⁵The breathing on ἐν (ἐν χεῖλεσι) is not visible, and that on ἁγιασμάτων looks smooth; the standard forms are printed.

¹⁰⁶Greek: PG 85:633 (the prologue) and 636–37 (the list of lessons: its heading, lessons 1, 2 and 16, and the subscription), reprinting Zacagni's edition. English: trans. editor.

¹⁰⁷Misprint for συνεκτείνων.

τὸν τρόπον, ἀλίκτως [sic]¹⁰⁸ τε ταύτην, ὡς φίλος, γεραίρων, οὐχ ἥκιστα δὲ ἂν εὐφημῶν ἐκάστοτε, ἔναγχος ἐμοί γε τήν τε τῶν Πράξεων βίβλον ἅμα, καὶ καθολικῶν Ἐπιστολῶν ἀναγνῶναί τε κατὰ προσῳδίαν, καὶ πῶς ἀνακεφαλαίωσασθαι, καὶ διελεῖν τούτων ἐκάστης τὸν νοῦν λεπτομερῶς, προτέταξας, ἀδελφεῖ Ἀθανάσιε προσφιλέστατε,

καὶ τοῦτο ἀόκνως ἐγὼ, καὶ προθύμως πεποιηκῶς, στοιχηδόν¹¹⁰ τε συνθεὶς τούτων τὸ ὕφος, κατὰ τὴν ἐμαυτοῦ συμμετρίαν, πρὸς εὐσημον ἀνάγνωσιν, διεπεμψάμην ἐν βραχεὶ τὰ ἕκαστά σοι, καὶ κατ' ἀκολουθίαν ἐκθέμενος ὀλιγοστήν ἀνακεφαλαίωσιν, πρῶτον περὶ ὧν Λουκᾶς ὁ εὐαγγελιστὴς συνέταξε, προοιμιασάμενος·

[...]

ΑΝΑΚΕΦΑΛΑΙΩΣΙΣ¹¹¹

Τῶν ἀναγνώσεων, καὶ ὧν ἔχουσι κεφαλαίων, καὶ θείων μαρτυριῶν, καὶ ὧν ἐκάστη τούτων, στίχων τυγχάνει.

Ἐν τῇ βίβλῳ τῶν Πράξεων τῶν ἀποστόλων ἀναγνώσεις εἰσὶν ις', κεφάλαια μ', μαρτυρίαι λ', στίχοι βφνς'.

Ἀνάγνωσις πρώτη.¹¹² οὕτως, Τὸν μὲν πρῶτον λόγον, κεφαλαίου ἐνὸς α' μαρτυρίας μίᾱς, α' στίχων μ'.

Ἀνάγνωσις β' οὕτως, Καὶ ἐν ταῖς ἡμέραις ταύταις ἀναστὰς Πέτρος, κεφαλαίου ἐνὸς, β' μαρτυρίας μίᾱς, β' στίχων λ'.

...

your character, and honouring this [reading] unceasingly as a friend, and not least praising it on every occasion, you lately charged me, dearest brother Athanasius, to read the book of the Acts together with that of the Catholic Epistles according to prosody,¹⁰⁹ and in some fashion to sum them up, and to set out the sense of each of them in detail.

And having done this without hesitation and gladly, and having arranged their text in lines, according to my own measure, for a clearly marked reading, I have sent you each part briefly; and, setting out in order a very short summary, I have prefaced it first with what Luke the evangelist composed.

[...]

SUMMARY of the lessons, and of the chapters they contain, and of the divine testimonies, and of how many lines each of these has.

In the book of the Acts of the Apostles there are 16 lessons, 40 chapters, 30 testimonies, 2556 lines.

Lesson one, thus: "The former treatise," of one chapter, 1; of one testimony, 1; of 40 lines.

Lesson 2, thus: "And in those days Peter stood up," of one chapter, 2; of one testimony, 2; of 30 lines.

...

¹⁰⁸So the page; the sense requires ἀλλήκτως or ἀλήκτως, "unceasingly." The final sigma of φίλος below is malformed.

¹⁰⁹Zacagni's Latin renders the phrase *in versiculos ad quamdam cantus similitudinem distinguere*, "that I should divide [them] into little lines after a kind of likeness to chant": a division into sense-lines for reading, not into lessons.

¹¹⁰So the page, for στοιχηδόν, "in lines."

¹¹¹Zacagni's note: "Haec Lectionum enumeratio in Regio-Alexandrino tantum codice reperitur; eorumque numerus antiquis liturgicis Alexandrinae Ecclesiae diebus plane respondet": this list of lessons is found only in the Regio-Alexandrinus codex, and their number answers exactly to the ancient liturgical days of the Alexandrian Church.

¹¹²So the page, a full stop before lower-case οὕτως; the translation reads a comma, as in lesson 2.

Ἀνάγνωσις ἰς οὕτως, Ὡς δὲ ἐκρίθη τοῦ ἀπο-
πλεῖν ἡμᾶς εἰς Ἰταλίαν, κεφαλαίων III, λη',
λθ', μ'. μαρτυρίας μιᾶς, λ'. στίχων ριθ', στί-
χοι κέ'.¹¹³

Διεῖλον τὰς ἀναγνώσεις τῆς βίβλου τῶν
Πράξεων τῶν ἀποστόλων, καὶ τὰ κεφάλαια
ἐκάστης ἀναγνώσεως παρέθηκα, καὶ τὰς ἐν
αὐτῇ φερομένας μαρτυρίας, ἔτι δὲ καὶ ὅσων
ἐκάστη στίχων τυγχάνει.

Lesson 16, thus: "And when it was
decided that we should sail for Italy," of 3
chapters, 38, 39, 40; of one testimony, 30;
of 119 lines, 25 lines [*sic*].

I have divided the lessons of the book of
the Acts of the Apostles, and I have set
down the chapters of each lesson, and
the testimonies found in it, and
moreover how many lines each has.

III.7 JOHN MALALAS, CHRONICLE, BOOK 14

The verb stands without object or audience and means to be schooled. The context decides it: a stage of life ("when he advanced in age"), a private place ("inside the palace"), a fellow pupil (συνανεγίνωσκεν, "studied with him"), and next, manhood and marriage. Malalas wrote in the sixth century, and his chronicle survives in a single Oxford manuscript.¹¹⁴

Ἐβασίλευσε δὲ παιδίον· ὅτε δὲ προέκοψε τῇ
ἡλικίᾳ ὁ αὐτὸς Θεοδόσιος βασιλεὺς, ἀνεγί-
νωσκεν ἔσω εἰς¹¹⁵ τὸ παλάτιον ἐν τῇ ζωῇ τοῦ
αὐτοῦ πατρὸς Ἀρκαδίου. καὶ μετὰ τὴν τε-
λευτὴν τοῦ πατρὸς αὐτοῦ συνανεγίνωσκεν
αὐτῷ ἄλλος νεώτερος εὐφύεστατος ὀνόματι
Παυλῖνος, υἱὸς κόμητος δομεστίκων. μετὰ
δὲ τὴν τελευτὴν τοῦ αὐτοῦ πατρὸς ἀνδρω-
θεὶς Θεοδόσιος ὁ βασιλεὺς ἐζήτει λαβεῖν γυ-
ναῖκα εἰς γάμον.

He became emperor as a child. And
when the same emperor Theodosius had
advanced in age, he did his studies inside
the palace during the lifetime of his
father Arcadius. And after his father's
death another, a younger man and most
gifted, named Paulinus, the son of a
comes domesticorum, studied with him.
And after the death of his father, when
Theodosius the emperor had come to
manhood, he sought to take a wife in
marriage.

¹¹³So the page; Zacagni's note comments on the scribe's count of lines.

¹¹⁴Greek: Dindorf, *Ioannis Malalae Chronographia* (Bonn, 1831), p. 352, lines 8–14, near the opening of Book XIV. English: trans. editor.

¹¹⁵The smooth breathing on εἰς is faint on the page.

EDITIONS CITED

Cramer = J. A. Cramer, ed., *Catena Graecorum Patrum in Novum Testamentum*, vol. VII, *In epistolas S. Pauli ad Timotheum, Titum, Philemona, et ad Hebraeos* (Oxford: e Typographico Academico, 1844; the section title page is dated 1843). Dindorf = L. Dindorf, ed., *Ioannis Malalae Chronographia*, *Corpus Scriptorum Historiae Byzantinae* (Bonn: Weber, 1831). Field, *Homiliae in Matthaeum* = F. Field, ed., *Sancti Patris Nostri Ioannis Chrysostomi ... Homiliae in Matthaeum*, vol. I (Cambridge, 1839). Field, *Interpretatio* = F. Field, ed., *Sancti Patris Nostri Ioannis Chrysostomi ... Interpretatio omnium epistolarum Paulinarum per homilias facta*, vol. VI (Oxford: J. Wright, 1861). Lauchert = F. Lauchert, ed., *Die Kanones der wichtigsten altkirchlichen Concilien nebst den Apostolischen Kanones*, Sammlung ausgewählter kirchen- und dogmengeschichtlicher Quellenschriften 12 (Freiburg i. B. and Leipzig: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1896). Lightfoot = J. B. Lightfoot, *The Apostolic Fathers*, Part I, *S. Clement of Rome*, vol. II (London: Macmillan, 1890). PG = J.-P. Migne, ed., *Patrologiae cursus completus, series Graeca* (Paris): vols. 32 and 33 (1857), 48 and 56 (1859), 57, 59 and 60 (1862), 62 (1860), 82, 85, 119 and 125 (1864); PG 85 reprints L. A. Zacagni, *Collectanea monumentorum veterum* (Rome, 1698). Swete, *LXX* = H. B. Swete, ed., *The Old Testament in Greek according to the Septuagint*, vol. II, 2nd ed. (Cambridge: University Press, 1896). Swete, *Theodore* = H. B. Swete, ed., *Theodori episcopi Mopsuesteni in epistolas B. Pauli commentarii: The Latin Version with the Greek Fragments*, vol. II (Cambridge: University Press, 1882).

English. NPNF = *A Select Library of the Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church*, ed. Philip Schaff: vol. 9, *On the Priesthood*, trans. W. R. W. Stephens (1889); vol. 10, *Homilies on Matthew*, trans. George Prevost, rev. M. B. Riddle (1888); vol. 11, *Homilies on Acts*, rev. G. B. Stevens (1889); vol. 13, *Homilies on Colossians, Second Thessalonians and First Timothy* (Buffalo: Christian Literature, 1889); vol. 14, *Homilies on John*, trans. Charles Marriott (1889). NPNF² = the same, second series, ed. Philip Schaff and Henry Wace: vol. 7, *Cyril of Jerusalem*, trans. E. H. Gifford (1894); vol. 8, *Basil: Letters and Select Works*, trans. Blomfield Jackson (1895); vol. 14, *The Seven Ecumenical Councils*, ed. H. R. Percival (1900). NPNF page numbers are those of the printed edition as marked in the CCEL text. Brenton = L. C. L. Brenton, *The Septuagint Version of the Old Testament ... with an English Translation* (London: Bagster, 1851), whose Sirach prologue is the Authorized Version of 1611. Lightfoot's translation of 2 Clement is in the volume cited above.